



State Of Arizona
Naturopathic Physicians Medical Board

“Protecting the Public’s Health”

1400 West Washington • Suite 300 • Phoenix, AZ 85007 • Telephone 602-542-8242 • FAX 602-542-8804

Website www.aznd.gov

TTY for Americans with Disability 800-367-8939 • Disability Voice Relay 800-842-4681

Janice K. Brewer – Governor

Dr. Catherine Walker, ND – Chair • Dr. Bruce Sadilek, ND – Vice Chair • Dr. Robert L. Gear Jr., NMD, DC – Physician Member
Dr. John Eldridge, NMD – Physician Member • Ms. Billie Broadman – Public Member

MINUTES

BOARD MEETING

Thursday, November 8, 2012 • 1:00 p.m. • Basement Conference Room B-1
1400 West Washington • Phoenix, AZ 85007

1. Call to Order by Presiding Officer

- A. Roll call of Board members and establishment of a quorum to conduct meeting.
The meeting was called to order at 1:05 pm.
Dr. Gear; Present, Ms. Broadman; Present, Dr. Eldridge; Present, Dr. Sadilek;
Present, Dr. Walker; Present. 5 Present 0 Absent
- B. Acknowledgement of presence of Board staff and legal counsel.
Present were Mr. Marc Harris, Assistant Attorney General,
Ms. Gail Anthony, Deputy Director.

2. Discussion, Consideration, and Possible Action Concerning Adopting a Board Civility Statement.

After discussion and consideration by the Board, Dr. Gear made a motion to accept the civility statement as drafted. Seconded by Dr. Sadilek. Motion Carried. 4 Ayes, 1 Nay.

Dr. Gear made a motion to request a guidance statement from the Attorney General's Office regarding implementing the civility statement. Seconded by Dr. Sadilek. 4 Ayes, 1 Nay. Motion carried.

3. Deputy Director Report

Status of Administrative Operation
Procedural Matters
Summary of Agency Reports
Budget
Current Licensing Numbers
Current Case Numbers
No Action Required

4. Call to the Public

No Members of the Public addressed the Board.

5. Declaration of any Conflict of Interest on any Item on the Agenda

Dr. Gear stated a conflict of interest on Items 8 (D,E) and Items 9,10.

6. Discussion, Consideration, Possible Action by Board of Consent Agenda

A. Request for Removal of any Consent Agenda Item for independent discussion and possible action by the Board.

Dr. Walker requested Dr. Alexis McNeil be removed from the consent agenda under item (E), and be taken into consideration as item 8 (H).

B. Discussion, Consideration, Possible Action and by Board of Regular and Executive Session Minutes of September 13, 2012

Dr. Sadilek made a motion to accept the minutes of September 13, 2012. Seconded by Ms. Broadman. Motion Carried 5 Ayes.

C. Discussion, Consideration, Possible Action by the Board of Medical License(s) / Application by Examination

Barrett, Sara (temporary license issued in accordance with A.R.S. 32-1522.01)
Benchouk, Stephen
Brouwer, Lauri (temporary license issued in accordance with A.R.S. 32-1522.01)
Bryant, Roselynde (temporary license issued in accordance with A.R.S. 32-1522.01)
Burgy, Heather (temporary license issued in accordance with A.R.S. 32-1522.01)
Cain, Briana (temporary license issued in accordance with A.R.S. 32-1522.01)
Collier, Leah (temporary license issued in accordance with A.R.S. 32-1522.01)
Fischer, Rainer (temporary license issued in accordance with A.R.S. 32-1522.01)
Gomendi, Sara (temporary license issued in accordance with A.R.S. 32-1522.01)
Hamilton, Cheryl (temporary license issued in accordance with A.R.S. 32-1522.01)
Hoffman, Jordan (temporary license issued in accordance with A.R.S. 32-1522.01)
Johnson, Eric (temporary license issued in accordance with A.R.S. 32-1522.01)
Khoshaba, Linda (temporary license issued in accordance with A.R.S. 32-1522.01)
Khoury, Valentina
Lloyd, Robin (temporary license issued in accordance with A.R.S. 32-1522.01)
Qamar-Busler, LeTicia (temporary license issued in accordance with A.R.S. 32-1522.01)
Roberson, Amanda (temporary license issued in accordance with A.R.S. 32-1522.01)
Rozelle, Rachel (temporary license issued in accordance with A.R.S. 32-1522.01)
Stone, Carolyn (temporary license issued in accordance with A.R.S. 32-1522.01)
Summers, Alisa (temporary license issued in accordance with A.R.S. 32-1522.01)
Wagner, Amy (temporary license issued in accordance with A.R.S. 32-1522.01)

The Board approved the applications for licensure by examination.

D. Discussion, Consideration, Possible Action by the Board of Medical License(s) / Application by Endorsement

Beynon, Stephanie - Canada (temporary license issued in accordance with A.R.S. 32-1522.01)
Cameron, Brent - California (temporary license issued in accordance with A.R.S. 32-1522.01)
Carlson, Angela - Vermont (temporary license issued in accordance with A.R.S. 32-1522.01)
Jensen, Jocelyn - Vermont (temporary license issued in accordance with A.R.S. 32-1522.01)
Needle, Jessica - Vermont

The Board approved the applications for licensure by endorsement.

E. Discussion, Consideration, Possible Action by the Board of Medical License(s) /

Application for Renewal

Archambault, Brian
Badillo Cochran, Jorge
Bedell Cook, Sarah
Brown, Joseph
Calimeri, Susan
Caragiulo, Michele
Chastant, Brandon
Darly, April
Darragh, Angela
Dawahare, Melissa
Feaster, Joanne
Frank, Thomas
Gastellum, Melissa
Girard, Christine
Harris Crossley, Meagan
Hansen, Clark
Heredia, Francisco
Herman, Jessica
Hernandez Guzman, Margarita
Holiday, Luke
Huber, Colleen
Husami, Margaret
Kasdorf, Cheryl
Keaton, Dana
Khalsa, Sarv Varta
Kremer, Reiner
Kruzel, Thomas
Lamb, Karen
Lane, Kiera
Lee, Stephen
Maltais, Shannon
Manrique, Javier
Marsh-Jones, Barbara
Maxwell, Peggy
McAllsiter, Heath
McNeil, Alexis
McNeil, Jason
Messer, Stephen
Mitchell, Jessica
Nafe, Babak
Nickels, Michele
Novakova, Katerina
Oskin, Jamie
Palzer, Anne
Pare, Kevin
Peace, Timothy
Pina, Stephanie
Predmore, Leslie
Rader, Alan
Ramsey, Theresa

Rice, Elizabeth
Rodgers, Sara
Rogalla, Deborah
Sensenig, James
Sina, Shaida
Sumegi, Lorraine
Smekens, Michelle
Spat, Tam
Stalker, Mary Ann
Stewart, Adrienne
Swan, Farra
Tallman, Ty
Tehrani, Nirvana
Thacker, Meghna
Thomason, Carolyn
Turner, Mary Jo
Turrell, Shana
Waldman, Renee
Whitney, Michael
Winton, Jeffrey
Woeller, DeAnna
Zupa, Victoria

The Board approved the application(s) for renewal of medical license.

F. Discussion, Consideration, Possible Action by the Board of Application(s) for Certificate to Dispense (initial)

Burgy, Heather (not for profit)
Carlson, Angela (not for profit)
George, Julie (for profit)
Jensen, Jocelyn (not for profit)
Roberson, Amanda (not for profit)
Rozelle, Rachel (not for profit)
Stewart, Adrienne (for profit)
Tayler, Tevna (for profit)
Wilson, Adrienne (for profit)

The Board approved the application(s) for initial certificate to dispense.

G. Discussion, Consideration, Possible Action by the Board of Application(s) for Reinstatement of Expired Certificate to Dispense.

Nichols, Douglas

The Board approved the application for reinstatement of certificate to dispense.

H. Discussion, Consideration, Possible Action by the Board of Application(s) for Preceptorship Certificate

Ealy III, Henry [Conduct]
Mobley, Stacey [Engage]
Dean, Jeff [Engage]

The Board approved the application(s) for preceptorship certificates(s).

I. Discussion, Consideration, Possible Action by the Board of Application(s) for Medical Assistant Certificate.

Kobelt, Kayla
Sanchez, Susan

The Board approved the application(s) for medical assistant certificate(s).

J. Discussion, Consideration, Possible Action by the Board of Application(s) for Renewal of Certificate to Engage in a Clinical Training Program

Alony, Samuel
Asad, Sheeba
Asher, Aaron
Atkins, Adriane
Bain, Jaclyn
Bender, Kelly
Bernal, Lauren
Callens, Rachel
Chen, Hsiang-jung
Chung, Ashley
Clough, Kelly
Cox, Brian
Etcheverry, Chase
Frederick, David
Feria, Lilia
Fitzgibbons, Bridget
Farokhian, Nina
Graham, Stephanie
Grise, Diane
Harrington, Heather
Harris, Dayna
Harriss, Kimberly
Hendershot, Stephanie
Hernandez, Matthew
Idica, Jeffrey
Ipson, Jarom
Jhaj, Ratinder
Johnson, Beth
Johnson, Veda
Kaur, Navjot
Kooima, Jessica
Kuhn, Kathleen
Lambert, Linda
Leone, Jacqueline
Man Vy, Nguyen
Martin, Lindsay
Mayer, Alexandria
McConnell, Michelle
Melness, Amy
Michalsen, Kara
Michard, Matthew
Milligan, Christopher
Milliken, Ann Marie
Mkrtchyan, Anna

Moore, Jessica
Morehouse, Delaney
Mquqwana, Siyanda
Muhammad, Asia
Muhammad, Kim
Nandyala, Lakshmi
Neubauer, Katherine
Nuckolls, Katheryn
Olmsted, Valerie
Oxley, Barbara
Oxley, John
Pacia, Nichelle
Pasley, Maggie
Peters, Rachel
Poccia, Emily
Popiel, Brian
Pugazendhi, Deepa
Reker, Mary
Renfer, Jessica
Rioddell, Michelle
Romney, Jonathan
Rose, Katherine
Sabatier, Steven
Scherer, Sean
Seenauth, Casey
Shaw, Anne
Steinborn, Shawn
Stevens, Paris
Stewart, Paula
Tabares, Amber
Thompson, Patrick
Trisuit, Chad
Ukaegbu, Oluchi
Van Driel, Evan
Virdee, Kulveen
Way, Jason
Willaims, Nathanael
Williamson, Phillip
Winter, Erin
Whelchel, Rebecca
Wolf, Jacob

The Board approved the application(s) for renewal of clinical training certificate(s).

K. Discussion, Consideration, Possible Action by the Board of Application(s) for Medical Assistant.

Larry Hellman

The Board approved the application for medical assistant.

Consent Agenda Vote: Dr. Eldridge recused himself because he was not in attendance at the September 13th meeting.

Dr. Sadilek made a motion to accept the consent agenda items 6 (A,C,D,E,F,G,H,I,J,K) Seconded by Ms. Broadman. Motion Carried 4 Ayes, 1 Recused

7. Regulatory Matters

A. Discussion, Consideration, Possible Action by the Board of Investigations and Complaints. (The Board may go into executive session on any of the following items under A.R.S. §38-431.03(A)(2) for discussion of any information made confidential by law.)

1. Dr. Frank Sweet, Case No. 12-007 - Formal Interview.

Board Member Declaration of any Conflict of Interest. None Declared

Dr. Sweet was present, made statements and answered questions. After discussion and consideration by the Board, Dr. Walker made a motion to issue a Letter of Concern and Order for 12 hours of non-disciplinary CME with the CME to be in addition to the 30 hours required each year for licensure renewal. Seconded by Dr. Sadilek. Motion Does Not Carry 1 Aye, 4 Nays.

Dr. Eldridge made a motion to dismiss. Seconded by Dr. Gear. Motion Did Not Carry. 2 Ayes, 3 Nays.

Dr. Walker made a motion to issue a Letter of Concern to include an order for 12 hours of non-disciplinary CME to be included in the 30 hours required each year for licensure renewal. Seconded by Ms. Broadman. Motion Carried 4 Ayes 1 Nay.

2. Dr. Ryan Ferchoff, Case No. 11-022 - Investigative Interview.

Board Member Declaration of any Conflict of Interest. None Declared

Dr. Ferchoff was not present. Dr. Walker made a motion to go into executive session for Legal Advice. Seconded by Dr. Sadilek. The Board returned to regular session.

After discussion and consideration by the Board, Dr. Walker made a motion to move the matter forward to Formal Interview. Seconded by Dr. Gear. Motion Carried 4 Ayes 1 Nay.

3. Dr. Kenneth Proefrock, Case No. 12-006 - Investigative Interview.

Board Member Declaration of any Conflict of Interest. None Declared

Dr. Proefrock was not present. After discussion and consideration by the Board, Dr. Walker made a motion to move the matter to Formal Interview. Seconded by Dr. Sadilek. Motion Carried 4 Ayes, 1 Nay.

4. Dr. Deborah Ardolf, Case No. 12-008 - Investigative Interview.

Board Member Declaration of any Conflict of Interest. None Declared

Dr. Ardolf was present, made statements and answered questions. After discussion and consideration by the Board, Dr. Gear made a motion to move the matter to Formal Interview. Seconded by Ms. Broadman. Motion Carried 5 Ayes.

5. Dr. Jose Ortiz, Case No. 12-009 - Investigative Interview.

Board Member Declaration of any Conflict of Interest. None Declared

Dr. Ortiz was present, made statements and answered questions. After discussion and consideration by the Board, Dr. Gear made a motion to dismiss the case. Seconded by Dr. Eldridge. Motion Carried 5 Ayes.

6. Dr. Heather Moroso, Case No. 12-019 - Investigative Interview

Board Member Declaration of any Conflict of Interest. Dr. Sadilek recused himself due to a conflict of interest.

Dr. Moroso was present, made statements and answered questions. After discussion and consideration by the Board Dr. Walker made a motion to issue a Letter of Concern and order 10 hours of non-disciplinary CME in the risks and benefits of the use of Medical Marijuana. Seconded by Dr. Gear. Motion Carried 4 Ayes, 1 Recused.

8. Discussion, Consideration, Possible Action by the Board of Items Not listed on the Consent Agenda due to Conflict of Interest.

A. Dr. Catherine Walker - Renewal of Medical License

B. Dr. Samuel Walker - Renewal of Medical License

C. Tiffany Walker - Renewal of Certificate to Engage in Clinical Training.

H. Dr. Alexis McNeil - Renewal of Medical License - Works with Dr. Catherine Walker

Dr. Walker recused herself. Dr. Sadilek moved to approve the renewals of item(s) A,B,C,H.

Seconded by Dr. Eldridge. Motion Carried 4 Ayes, 1 Recused.

D. Don Selvey - Application for Certificate to Engage in Preceptorship Training Program, Dr. Robert Gear; Preceptor.

E. Dr. Robert Gear - Certificate to Conduct a Preceptorship Training Program.

Dr. Gear recused himself. Dr. Sadilek moved to approve the application(s) for preceptorship.

Seconded by Ms. Broadman. Motion Carried 4 Ayes, 1 Recused.

F. Dr. David Cramer - Renewal of Medical License, Open Investigation

Renew without prejudice to any ongoing investigation.

Dr. Walker moved to approve the renewal of licensure without prejudice to any ongoing investigation. Seconded by Dr. Sadilek. Motion Carried 5 Ayes.

G. Dr. Ryan Ferchoff- Renewal of Medical License, Open Case.

Dr. Sadilek moved to approve the renewal of licensure without prejudice to any ongoing investigation. Seconded by Dr. Eldridge. Motion Carried 5 Ayes.

9. Discussion, Consideration, and Possible Action Regarding the Governor's Removal of Board Member Sheelah Golliglee, Possible Referral of the Matter to the Attorney General's Office with Regard to Conflicts of Interest, and Potential Impact the Removal Has on Prior Board Votes

Dr. Gear recused himself. Dr. Walker made a motion to go into Executive Session for Legal Advice. Seconded by Dr. Eldridge. The Board returned to regular session. After discussion and consideration by the Board, Dr. Walker made a motion to refer the matter to the Arizona Attorney General's office for evaluation of potential conflict of interest violations as it relates to the relationship between Dr. Gear and former board member; Ms. Golliglee. Seconded by Dr. Eldridge. Motion Carried 3 Ayes, 1 Nay, 1 Recused.

10. Discussion, Consideration, and Possible Action Regarding Reconsideration of Dismissal of Dr. Robert Gear Case No. 12-003 in May 2012 Based Upon the Governor's Removal of Ms. Golliglee.

Dr. Gear recused himself.

After discussion and consideration by the Board, Dr. Walker made a motion to re-hear the case, given the financial interactions for a lengthy period of time that the Board was not aware of; between Ms. Golliglee and Dr. Gear. No Second. Motion Died.

Dr. Sadilek made a motion to table the matter until the outcome of the AG's review has been received. Seconded by Dr. Eldridge. Dr. Eldridge; Aye, Dr. Sadilek; Aye, Ms. Broadman; Nay, Dr. Walker; Nay Motion Did Not Carry. 2 Ayes, 2 Nays.

Dr. Walker made a motion to re-hear the case. No Second. Motion Died.

Dr. Eldridge made a motion to not re-hear the case. Ms. Broadman Seconded. Dr. Eldridge; Aye, Ms. Broadman; Aye, Dr. Sadilek; Nay, Dr. Walker; Nay. Motion Does Not Carry. 2 Ayes, 2 Nays.

Dr. Sadilek made a motion to table the matter until the January meeting. At that time, the Board will review this matter using the original source documentation. Dr. Sadilek; Aye, Dr. Eldridge; Nay, Ms. Broadman, Nay, Dr. Walker; Aye. Motion Does Not Carry. 2 Ayes, 2 Nays.

Dr. Walker made a motion to table the matter until the Board receives the outcome of the AG's review of item 9. Seconded by Dr. Eldridge. Dr. Sadilek; Aye, Dr. Eldridge; Aye, Ms. Broadman; Aye, Dr. Walker Abstained. Motion Carried 3 Ayes, 1 Abstain.

11. Discussion, Consideration and Possible Action Regarding the wording of the Mission Statement of the Board.

Dr. Gear presented his recommendation to the Board regarding the re-wording of the Board's Mission Statement. The matter was tabled until the next meeting.

12. Hiring Committee Update

No Action Required.

13. Letter to the Board from Dr. Anna Nordin

No Action Required.

14. Call For Future Agenda Items.

Rules Package

Legislative Package

ADJOURNMENT

The meeting adjourned at 6:07 pm

Voted on and approved January 10, 2013
State of Arizona Naturopathic Medical Board