



State Of Arizona
Naturopathic Physicians Medical Board

"Protecting the Public's Health"

1400 West Washington • Suite 300 • Phoenix, AZ 85007 • Voice Telephone 602-542-8242 • FAX 602-542-8804
Website www.AZND.GOV TTY for Americans with Disability 800-367-8939 • Disability Voice Relay 800-842-4681

Janice K. Brewer – Governor

Catherine Walker, NMD. - Chair • Daniel Rubin, ND– Vice Chair • Mr. Evan Zang - Secretary/Treasurer
Mr. Kip Micuda JD - Public Member • Renee Waldman, NMD – Physician Member
Ms. Linda Barron, Public Member • Dr. Bruce Sadilek NMD – Physician Member
Craig Runbeck, NMD – Executive Director

MINUTES
BOARD MEETING

Thursday July 9th, 2009• 1:00 p.m. • Basement Conference Room B-1
1400 West Washington • Phoenix, AZ 85007

1. Call to Order by Presiding Officer

- A. Roll call of Board members and establishment of a quorum to conduct meeting.
The meeting was called to order at 1:00 PM. Dr. Sadilek; Present, Dr. Waldman; Present, Mr. Zang;
Present, Dr. Walker; Present, Dr. Rubin; Present. 5 Present 2 Absent.
B. Acknowledgement of presence of Board staff and legal counsel.
Present were: Dr. Craig Runbeck; Executive Director, Ms. Jeanne Galvin; Assistant Attorney General,
and Ms. Gail Anthony, Deputy Director.

Ms. Barron joined the meeting at 1:05 PM.

2. Call to the Public

No public wished to address the Board.

3. Discussion, Consideration, Possible Action by Board of Consent Agenda (Any item under consent may be removed for independent discussion and action by a Board Member.)

- A. Discussion, Consideration, Possible Decision and Vote by Board of Minutes of May 14, 2009
The Board voted to accept the minutes of the May 14, 2009 Board meeting.
B. ED. Report
No action required.

C. Discussion, Consideration, Possible Action by Board of Medical License(s) / Examination Application

Table with 2 columns: Francesca Quinn, Matthew McNamee

The Board voted to accept the application(s) for licensure by examination.

D. Discussion, Consideration, Possible Action by Board of Temporary License(s) to Practice Medicine

Table with 2 columns: Matthew McNamee, [Empty]

The Board voted to accept the application(s) for issuance of temporary license..

E. Discussion, Consideration, Possible Action by Board of Medical License(s) / Endorsement

Tara Hickman	Nicole Kellum
Linda Oksman	

The Board voted to accept the application(s) for licensure by endorsement.

F. Discussion, Consideration, Possible Action by Board of Application(s) for Certificate to Dispense (initial)

Tabish Malik	Tracy Peruch
--------------	--------------

The Board voted to accept the application(s) for initial certificate(s) to dispense.

G. Discussion, Consideration, Possible Action by Board of Application(s) for Renewal of Certificate to Dispense

Rebecca Cooke	Walter Crinnion
Mathew Baral	Jessica Mitchell
Sonja Pettersen	Elizabeth Grady
Miriam Gilbert	David Craig
Christine Madsen	Denette King
MaryK Geyer	Robert Gear
Bryan McConnell	Lewis Underwood
Carole Jamison	Janice Highfield
Jessica Marier	Will Polec
David Arneson	Donald Mayfield
Brian Popiel	Lila Flagler
Samuel Flagler	Brandy Pierce
Susan Godman	Tabish Malik
Christian Armanti	Ralph Potter
Margie Simmon-Stubber	Sam Walters
Robert Milisen	Vance Inouye
Wayne Black	Steven Ehrlich
Dana Keaton	Nael Dagstani
John Robinson	Sandy Lutrin
Robert Ellsworth	Judy Hiell
David Craig	Jason Porter
Paul DeLoe	Donese Worden
Nick Buratovich	Kiera Lane
Maureen Schwehr	Ravi Chandiramani
Laurence Grey	Marie Santora
Patricia Gaines	Tina Marcantel
Timothy Schwaiger	Mona Morstein
Christine Sorensen	Jessica Tran
Clinton McJunkin	Michael Cronin
Clark Hansen	Paul DeLoe
Barbara Ezrre	Randy Spicer
Louise Gutowski	James Hutton
Ken Blackman	Kyle Cronin
Robb Bird	Jason Sherbondy
Jeni Keilty	Shawn Joyner
Lorraine Sumegi	Lisa Maturo
Bonnie Wick	Roxie Strand

Andrea Weiner	Brandon Chastant
Peggy McGarey	Herbert Schuck
Melinda Whitsell	Eric Hampton
Thomas Lee	Valeria Breiten
Cheryl Kasdorf	LoRal Linton
Michael Uzick	Jennifer Nevels
James Tuggle	Patricia Beck
Amy Whittington	Mark Dietzgen
Sheldon Deal	Steven Jarrett
Shaida Sina	Jose Ortiz
Betsy Yurgel	Matthew Mitchell
Albert Chavez	Nathan Champion
Nita Keskitalo	Ann Marie Fine
Amy Lilie	Rachel Rhodes
Eric Bower	Lance Morris
Jennifer Gentry Calvo	Lois Eaton
Spice Lussier	Katerina Novalkova
Meghana Thanki	Lance Morris
Mary Ellen O'Brien	Eric Udell
Danite Haller	Sara Hazel
Robert Myers	DeAnna Woeller
Cheryl Deroin	Hope Farner
Karen Vaughan	Julie Gorman
Thomas Frank	Yu-Ree Hyun
Theo Christodeulakis	Kathleen Raymer
Kristy Anderson	Linda Lambert
Douglas Nichols	Nathan Vitaro
Elaine Burns	Carrie Rittlinger
Benjamin Zorensky	Shannon Maltais
Laurinda Kwan	Natalie Ham
Cheryl Granger	Allison Pritchard
Michelle Michael	Karlee Heffner
Nancy Mullis	Kerri Clark
Stephanie Eastman	Jeffrey Lee
Shelly S. Weisman	Teresa Vesco
Mario Galaburri	Steve Nenninger
Laura Kennedy	Chriselda Beltran
Gioacchino Franco	Laurie Moody
Lori Barnes	David Cramer
Delores D'Aprile	Ross Kerievsky
Leslie Axelrod	Katherine Kamin
Meghna Thacker	Kimberly Landino
Ryan Krch	Joanne Feaster
June Stevens	Suneil Jain
Kenneth Proefrock	Tracy Wooten
Jesika Dicampfi	Eli Ber
Melenie Dunn	Erin Fitzgerald
Kimberly Engard	Barbara Koudelka
Theresa Ramsey	Jami Kupperman
David Daily	Margaret Husami
Inge Barth	Christina Kovalik

M. Ann Murray	Veronique Kerr
Charles Wilkinson	Christy Cline
Shahrzad Orona	S. Ross Dunbar
Allison McDaniel	John Hinze
Rebecca Carpenter	John Dye
Kirk Slagel	Jaime Ewald
Robert Upchurch	Kyle Neeley
Daniela Hutyrova	Laree Hooker
Ann Seipt	Carlos Santo
Anesia Groves	Miriam Weber
Adam Kerievsky	Konrad Kail
Timothy Visser	Aimee Bachelier
Deborah Rogalla	Carol Sponner
Stephanie Stark	Ardeschir Mehrabani
Nancy Leeder	Robin Terranella
Todd Alan	Tara Peyman
Andria Orłowski	Garrett Smith
F. Debbie Jacques	Susanne Macsray
Noemi Quintanar	Beth Poindexter

The Board voted to accept the application(s) for renewal of certificate(s) to dispense.

H. Discussion, Consideration, Possible Action by Board of Application(s) for Certificate for Medical Assistant

Sara White (Renewal)	Lucia Diaz (Renewal)
Mary Prince (Renewal)	Jessica Sherwood (Renewal)
Susan Shelton (Renewal)	Renee Casswell (Renewal)

The Board voted to accept the application(s) for medical assistant renewal.

I. Discussion, Consideration, Possible Action by Board of Application(s) for Renewal of Certificate to Engage in a Clinical Training Program

Barrie Ann Zeller	Richard Petke
Lahnor Ridley	Anh Upchurch
Margaret Walsh	Ruby Crozier
Lucas Tims	Stephanie Nishek

The Board voted to accept the application(s) for certificate to engage in clinical training renewal.

Vote on Consent Agenda:

Dr. Rubin moved to accept the consent agenda, items 3 (A), (C), (D), (E), (F), (G), (H) and (I).

Second by Dr. Waldman. Motion carried 5 present 2 absent.

4. Regulatory Matters

A. Discussion, Consideration, Possible Action by Board of Investigations and Complaints. The Board may go into executive session regarding this matter.

(2) Dr. Marie Santora, Case No. 08-039 – Formal Interview , Proposed of Consent Agreement

Item 4 A (2) was considered by the Board out of order. After discussion and consideration by the Board, Dr. Sadilek moved to accept the consent agreement. Second by Mr. Zang. Motion carried 6 Ayes. 1 Absent.

(3) Dr. Alan Christianson, Case No. 08-018 and 08-038, Proposed Consent Agreement.

Item 4 A (3) was considered by the Board out of order. Dr. Christianson was present. After discussion and consideration by the Board, Dr. Sadilek moved to accept the consent agreement. Second by Dr. Rubin. Motion carried 6 Ayes. 1 Absent.

(4) Dr. Eugene Eihausen, Case No. 06-031, Formal Interview Refusal, Tabled from Previous Meeting.

Item 4 A (4) was considered by the Board out of order.
Dr. Rubin recused himself.

Dr. Waldman made a motion to go into Executive Session for Legal Advise. Second by Mr. Zang. Motion carried 5 Ayes, 1 Recused, 1 Absent.

The Board entered into Executive Session at 1: 10 PM

The Board resumed Regular Session at 1: 12 PM

Ms. Lisa Davis was present representing Dr. Eihausen, made statements and answered questions.

Dr. Waldman made a motion to go into Executive Session for Legal Advise. Second by Mr. Zang. Motion carried 5 Ayes, 1 Recused, 1 Absent.

The Board entered into Executive Session at 1:20 PM

The Board Resumed Regular Session at 1:43 PM

Ms. Barron made a motion to not accept the consent agreement as mailed on December 10th, 2008. Second by Dr. Waldman. Motion carried 5 Ayes, 1 Recused, 1 Absent.

Ms. Barron made a motion to move forward to Formal Hearing, instructing staff to attempt to negotiate a consent agreement. Second by Dr. Waldman. Motion carried 5 Ayes, 1 Recused, 1 Absent.

(5) Dr. Shannon York and Dr. Robert Ruiz, Case No. 08-044 – Formal Interview.

Item 4 A (5) was considered by the Board out of order.

Dr. Rubin recused himself.

Dr. York and Dr. Ruiz was present. Made statements and answered questions. Also present was Ms. Dyer who made statements to the Board on behalf of Dr. York and Dr. Ruiz. After discussion and consideration by the Board, Ms. Barron made a motion to find there was a violation of A.R.S. §32-1501 (pp), Second by Dr. Waldman. Motion carried, 3 Ayes, 2 Nays, 1 Recused, 1 Absent.

After discussion and consideration by the Board, Dr. Waldman made a motion to issue a Letter of Reprimand for violation of A.R.S. §32-1501. Second by Ms. Barron. Motion carried, 3 Ayes, 2 Nays, 1 Recused, 1 Absent.

(6) Dr. Shiada Sina, Case No. 09-048 – Investigative Interview

Item 4 A (6) was considered by the Board out of order. Dr. Sina was present with her Counsel, Mr. Peugnet, both made statements and answered questions. After discussion and consideration by the Board, Dr. Waldman made a motion to dismiss. Second by Dr. Rubin. Motion carried 6 Ayes, 1 Absent.

The Board took a 5 minute break.

(7) Dr. Henry Ealy III, Case No. 08-041 – Investigative Interview

Item 4 A (7) was considered by the Board out of order. Complainant JB was present, made statement and answered questions. After discussion and consideration by the Board, Mr. Zang made a motion to move the matter to Formal Interview, authorizing staff to negotiate a consent agreement to include staff recommendations and include an order for Respondent to provide true and complete medical records to JB. Second by Dr. Rubin. Motion carried . 6 Ayes, 1 Absent.

(1) Dr. Carole Eastman, Case No. 08-025 – Formal Interview

Item 4 A (1) was considered by the Board out of order.

Dr. Eastman was present with Counsel Mr. Holt. Both made statements and answered questions. After discussion and consideration by the Board, Dr. Rubin made a motion to move the matter for Formal Hearing, authorizing staff to negotiate a consent agreement for voluntary license surrender. Second by Dr. Waldman. Motion carried 6 Ayes, 1 Absent.

B. Discussion, Consideration, Possible Action by Board of Persons Licensed by this Board. The Board may go into executive session regarding this matter.

(1) Dr. Steven Bescak, Application for Certificate to Dispense. Works with Dr. Cathy Walker.

(2) Dr. Tamara Torres, Application for Renewal of Certificate to Dispense. Works with Dr. Cathy Walker.

(3) Dr. Ann Lovick, Application for Renewal of Certificate to Dispense. Works with Dr. Cathy Walker.

Dr. Walker recused herself.

Item(s) B (1 – 3) were considered by the Board. After discussion and consideration by the Board, Mr. Zang made a motion to approve the applications for certificate to dispense. Second by Ms. Barron. Motion carried 5 Ayes, 1 Recuse, 1 Absent

(4) Dr. Daniel Rubin, Application for Renewal of Certificate to Dispense.

(5) Dr. Debi Smolinski, Application for Renewal of Certificate to Dispense.

(6) Dr. Bruce Sadilek, Application for Renewal of Certificate to Dispense.

Dr. Sadilek and Dr. Rubin recused themselves.

Item(s) B (4-6) were considered by the Board. After discussion and consideration by the Board, Mr. Zang moved to approve the applications for certificate to dispense. Second by Ms. Barron. Motion carried 4 Ayes, 2 Recused, 1 Absent

(7) Dr. Renee Waldman, Application for Renewal of Certificate to Dispense.

Dr. Waldman recused herself. After discussion and consideration by the Board. Mr. Zang moved to accept the application for certificate to dispense. Second by Ms. Barron. Motion carried 5 Ayes, 1 Recused, 1 Absent.

(8) Dr. Carole Eastman, Application for Renewal of Certificate to Dispense.

After discussion and consideration by the Board, Dr. Rubin moved to accept the application for renewal of certificate to dispense, with all applicable limitations based on the consent agreement in which she previously signed. Second by Ms. Barron. Motion carried 6 Ayes, 1 Absent.

ADJOURNMENT

THE MEETING WAS ADJOURNED AT 4:30 PM.

ARIZONA NATUROPATHIC PHYSICIANS MEDICAL BOARD

DATE