



State Of Arizona
Naturopathic Physicians Medical Board

"Protecting the Public's Health"

1400 West Washington • Suite 300 • Phoenix, AZ 85007 • Telephone 602-542-8242 • FAX 602-542-8804

Website www.aznd.gov

TTY for Americans with Disability 800-367-8939 • Disability Voice Relay 800-842-4681

Janice K. Brewer – Governor

Catherine Walker, NMD. - Chair • Daniel Rubin, ND– Vice Chair • Mr. Evan Zang - Secretary/Treasurer

Mr. Kip Micuda JD - Public Member • Renee Waldman, NMD – Physician Member

Ms. Linda Barron, Public Member • Dr. Bruce Sadilek, NMD – Physician Member

Craig Runbeck, ND – Executive Director

MINUTES

BOARD MEETING

Thursday, July 8, 2010 • 1:00 p.m. • Basement Conference Room B-1

1400 West Washington • Phoenix, AZ 85007

1. Call to Order by Presiding Officer

A. Roll call of Board members and establishment of a quorum to conduct meeting.

The meeting was called to order at 1:03 PM. Dr. Catherine Walker; Present, Mr. Kip Micuda;

Present, Ms. Linda Barron; Present, Dr. Bruce Sadilek; Present Mr. Evan Zang, Absent, Dr.

Waldman joined the meeting at 1:05 PM. Dr. Dan Rubin joined the meeting at 1:07 PM.

B. Acknowledgement of presence of Board staff and legal counsel.

Present were Dr. Craig Runbeck, Executive Director, Ms. Elizabeth Campbell, Assistant Attorney

General and Ms. Gail Anthony, Deputy Director.

2. Call to the Public

The Board received no request(s) from the public to speak.

3. Discussion, Consideration, Possible Action by Board of Consent Agenda *(Any item under consent may be removed for independent discussion and action by a Board Member.)*

A. **Discussion, Consideration, Possible Decision and Vote by Board of Minutes of May 13, 2010**

The Board voted to accept the minutes of May 13, 2010.

B. **ED. Report**

No Action Required

C. **Discussion, Consideration, Possible Action by the Board of Medical License(s) / Endorsement**

The Board voted to accept the application for medical license by endorsement.

D. **Discussion, Consideration, Possible Action by the Board of Application(s) / Request(s) to Retire Medical License**

The Board voted to accept the application for retirement of medical license.

E. Discussion, Consideration, Possible Action by the Board of Application(s) for Certificate to Conduct a Preceptorship Training Program

Carol Spooner

The Board voted to accept the application for certificate to conduct a preceptorship program.

F. Discussion, Consideration, Possible Action by the Board of Application(s) for Certificate to Engage in a Preceptorship Training Program

Seth Black

The Board voted to accept the application for certificate to engage in a preceptorship program.

G. Discussion, Consideration, Possible Action by the Board of Application(s) for Certificate to Dispense (initial)

Marianna Fisher	Peggy De Long
Laurel Pucciarelli	Carol Carrell
Rebecca Miller	

The Board voted to accept the applications for initial certificate to dispense.

H. Discussion, Consideration, Possible Action by the Board of Application(s) for Renewal of Certificate to Dispense

Vance Inouye	Marianna Fisher
Sonja De Graaff	Anne Christine Hicks
Brian Archambault	Michael Chung
Deborah Rogalla	Susan Calimeri
Scott Jamison	Hanna Ian
Farra Swan	Colleen Huber
Lorraine Sumegi	Rebecca Cooke
Bonnie Wick	Mercedes Williams
Allyn Krieger-Fiedler	Tam Spat
Kenneth Lashutka	Deborah Adolf
Jason Sherbondy	Jeannette Toghiani
Cheryl Kasdorf	Valeria Breiten
Jennifer Gentry	Leslie Marcum
Yolanda Rodriguez	Erica McKeen
Babak Nafe	Katerina Novakova
Crystal Song	Sonja Tveit Pettersen
Amy Whittington	Sarv Varta Khalsa
Boris Schwartz	Andrew Dickens
Damien Brandeis	Shahzad Orona
JD McCoy	Linda Lambert
Tiffany Mitchell	Frank Sweet
Joseph Brown	Shauna Turrell
Robb Bird	James Tuggle
Kristy Anderson	Jeffrey Lee
Marianne Marchese	Oddveig Myhre
Kevin Barnett	Olya Stouk
Ramon Esquerdo	Tracy Peruch
Lisa Maturo	Danite Haller
Eric Udell	Robert Ellsworth
Lori Barnes	Michael Uzick
Meghna thacker	Peggy McGarey
Clinton McJunkin	Brian Popiel

Bianca Munoz	Steve Nenninger
Barbara Marsh-Jones	Mary DiFilippo
Summer Swanick	Karen Freeze
Natalie Ham	Tara Swartz
Julie Keiffer	Angela Wojowicz
Karen Vaughan	Julie Gorman
Cheryl Deroin	Roger Adair
Eric Bower	Kenneth McWilliams
Laura Miller-Sickles	John Eldridge
David Arneson	Shannon Maltais
Wendy Wells	Paul Mittman
Sima Aidun	Christian Armanti
Mary Marcantel	Mary Poore
Mark James	Kyle Neeley
Nick Buratovich	Nancy Mullis
LoRal Linton	Sandy Lutrin
Yu-Ree Hyun	Amy-Jane Lilie
June Stevens	Mary Ellen O'Brien
Andrea Weiner	Kevin Pare
Veronica Boyer	Andrew Kaufmann
Jo Turner	Carol Jamison
Courtney Cronin	Ty Tallman
Robert Gear	Robert Myers
Judith Jones	Samuel Flagler
Lila Flagler	Kathryn Sage
Susan Godman	Katherine Kamin
Chriselda Beltran	Frank Tamburri
Shaida Sina	Margie Simmons-Stubber
Stephen Messer	DeAnna Woeller
Laura Weeshoff	Susan Williamson
Ken Blackman	Steven Ehrlich
Ravi Chandiramani	David Hagen
Christine Sorensen	Christine Girard
Tracy Magerus	Christine Madsen
Karsten Alexandria	Kiera Lane
Keith Wilkinson	Fred Arnold
Louise Gutowski	Aimee Bachelier
Erin Psota	Patricia Gaines
Yezid Callejas	John Hinze
Mario Galaburri	Clark Hansen
Albert Chavez	Robert Milisen
Jamie Oskin	Stephan Lee
Philip Wazny	S. Ross Dunbar
Maureen Schwehr	Michelle Thatcher
Bryan McConnell	Herbert Schuck
Margarita Guzman	Laurence Grey
Carol Spooner	Susan Stratton
Barbara Koudelka	Lance Morris
Patricia Smith Pingel	Thomas Lee
Kyle Cronin	Michael Cronin
Schyler McHenry	Jamie Oskin
Kiera Smialek	Walter Crinnion

Roxie Strand	Laurinda Kwan
Adam Kerievsky	Katrina Steinberger
Cristina Romero-Bosch	Rachel Rhodes
Timothy Peace	Krystal Tellier
Joanne Feaster	Suneil Jain
Sheldon Deal	Randy Spicer
Ann Lovick	Nathan Vitaro
Erin Fitzgerald	George Michael Miles
Ann Marie Fine	Jeni Keilty
Katherine Raymer	Jessica Tran
Cathy Forbes	Kenneth Proefrock
Elaine Burns	John Robinson
Nael Dagstani	Thomas Frank
Spice Lussier	Mark Strom
Jason Porter	Jennifer Burns
Lezlie Link	Bianca Munoz
Andria Orłowski	Delores D'Aprile
Matthew Mitchell	Erica Middlemiss
Anne Marie Palzer	Susanne Macsay
Jami Kupperman	Cristina Romero-Bosch
Adam Kerievsky	Allison McDaniel
Ardeschir Mehrabani	Stephanie Stark
Dawn Bantel	Lois Eaton
Theresa Ramsey	Rebecca Carpenter
Shawn Joyner	Alexander Corracides
Ralph Potter	Theo Christodoulakis
Ross H. Kerievsky	Paul Stallone
Donese Worden	Jaime Ewald
Robin Terranella	Christy Cline
Tue Truong	Meghana Thanki
Steven Jattett	Jennifer Nevels
Stephanie Eastman	Dianna Heath
Kristen Fujii	Jose Ortiz
Alison Redwine	Jessica Mitchell
Stephanie Gajus	Glenn Ozalan
Irina Riabikina	Leslie Axelrod
Daniela Hutyrova	Jessica Mitchell
Elizabeth Rice	MaryK Martin Geyer
Tracy Wooten	Kristin Berkner
Garrett Smith	Kareen O'Brien
Joel Morgan	Blythe Burton-Teed
Inge Barth	Emily Keranen
F. Debbie Jacques	Simon Sung
Patricia Beck	Valerie Olmsted
Jennifer Dye	Christina Kovalik
Hope Farner	Marie Santora
Kimberly Landino	Laura Kennedy
Ann Watwood	Nicole Taylor
Matthew Cavaiola	Danette King
Cheryl Granger	Mark Dietzgen
Barbara Ezrre	Robert Upchurch
Matthew Baral	Michelle Hoppe

Kimberley Volk	Gina Tizio
Melinda Whitsell	Eric Hampton
Keith Chambers	Betty Yurgel
E. Friederike Doak	Miriam Gilbert
Robin Borsa	Mario Howell
Timothy Schwaiger	Kathryn Cameron
Cheryl Sly	Julie Gorman
Jessica Bramstadt	Cori Kennedy
Victoria Green	

The Board voted to accept the applications for renewal of certificate to dispense.

I. Discussion, Consideration, Possible Action by the Board of Application(s) for Certificate for Medical Assistant

Danielle McClung, Renewal	Christina Gear, Renewal
Dustin Walters, Renewal	Lea Smalley, Renewal
Jessica Sherwood, Renewal	Susan Shelton, Renewal
Sara White, Renewal	Lucia Diaz, Renewal

The Board voted to accept the applications for renewal of medical assistant certificate(s).

J. Discussion, Consideration, Possible Action by the Board of Application(s) for Certificate to Engage in a Clinical Training Program

Mandi Lee, Renewal	Joseph Dudley
Debbie Wasson	April Darley, Renewal
Ashley Blake Gordon, Renewal	Kirstin Correia, Renewal
Valentina Khoury	Maria Williams, Renewal
Francisco Heredia, Renewal	Raequi Wilson, Renewal
Julie Flynn, Renewal	Lauren Deville, Renewal
Megan Sylvie, Renewal	Abbas Bazy, Renewal
Kelly Hassberger, Renewal	Bryan Devonick, Renewal
Julie Lachman, Renewal	Alvina English, Renewal
Melonni Dooley, Renewal	

The Board voted to accept the application(s) for certificate to engage in clinical training.

Dr. Waldman joined the meeting at 1:05 PM

Dr. Walker called for a vote on the Consent agenda items 3 (A) – (J), excluding Dr. Steven Bescak. who was moved to item 4 (B) (13).

Ms. Barron moved to accept the consent agenda, Seconded by Mr. Micuda. Motion carried 5 Ayes, 2 Absent

Dr. Rubin joined the meeting at 1:07 PM.

4. Regulatory Matters

A. Discussion, Consideration, Possible Action by the Board of Investigations and Complaints. The Board may go into executive session regarding this matter.

(1) Dr. Ryan Krch, Case no. 08-026 – Investigative Interview

After discussion and consideration by the Board, Mr. Micuda moved to forward the case to Formal Hearing giving Dr. Runbeck the ability to accept a signed consent agreement for surrender, in the form of what was presented in the Board packet, in the event Board staff receives one prior to the Formal Hearing. Seconded by Dr. Waldman. Motion carried 6 Ayes, 1 Absent.

(2) Dr. Henry Ealy, III, Review and possible vote on opening a case for non compliance of Board Order.

Dr. Ealy was present. After discussion and consideration by the Board, Dr. Walker moved to open a case on the basis of non-compliance of Board Order. Seconded by Mr. Micuda.

Dr. Walker made a motion to go into Executive session to obtain legal advice. Seconded by Dr. Rubin. Motion carried 6 Ayes, 1 Absent.

The Board resumed regular session at 1:35 PM.

Dr. Ealy was allowed to address the Board. The Board voted on the motion to open a case for non-compliance of Board order. Board vote; Motion carried 6 Ayes. 1 Absent.

Mr. Micuda made a motion to move the case of non-compliance of Board order to Formal Interview, giving staff the ability to negotiate a consent agreement outlining the same components as the original consent. Seconded by Dr. Rubin. Motion carried 6 Ayes, 1 Absent.

(3) Dr. Alexander de Soler, Review and possible vote on opening a case for non compliance of Board order.

Dr. de Soler was present.

Dr. Walker made a motion to move to Executive Session for legal advice. Seconded by Dr. Waldman. Motion carried 6 Ayes, 1 Absent

The Board resumed regular session at 1:55 PM

After discussion and consideration by the Board, Mr. Micuda moved to issue a second interim order for evaluation, to be completed within 60 days, based on reasonable cause based on the information obtained by the Board, including the report from Motor Vehicle. Seconded by Dr. Waldman.

Dr. de Soler requested and was given the opportunity to address the Board.
Board vote; Motion carried 6 Ayes , 1 Absent.

A 5 minute recess was taken by the Board. Regular session resumed at 2:17 PM.

(4) Dr. Brendan McCarthy, Case no. 10-008 – Investigative Interview.

Dr. McCarthy was present with his Counsel Ms. Tamara Brooks Primera, made statements and answered questions. After discussion and consideration by the Board, Dr. Sadilek moved to issue an order for (4) hours of non-disciplinary CME to be included in the 30 hours of required CME each year, and to be completed in 180 days. Seconded by Mr. Micuda. Motion carried 6 Ayes, 1 Absent.

(5) Dr. Kathleen Muratore, Case no. 10-009 – Investigative Interview.

Dr. Muratore was present, but declined to make a formal statement to the Board. Mr. Micuda moved to proceed to Formal Hearing, giving staff the ability to negotiate a consent agreement for surrender of license. Seconded by Dr. Waldman.

Dr. Walker made a motion to go into Executive Session for legal advice. Seconded by Dr. Rubin. Motion carried 6 Ayes, 1 Absent

The Board resumed regular session at 2:55 PM.

Board vote; Motion carried 6 ayes, 1 Absent.

B. Discussion, Consideration, Possible Action by the Board of Persons Licensed by this Board. The Board may go into executive session regarding this matter.

(1) Dr. Samuel Walker; Renewal of Certificate to Dispense.

(2) Dr. Catherine Walker; Renewal of Certificate to Dispense.

(3) Dr. Maria Cavalle; Initial Certificate to Dispense, works with Dr. Walker.

(13) Dr. Steven Bescak, Renewal of Certificate to Dispense. Works with Dr. Walker

Dr. Walker recused herself. Agenda item(s) B (1), (2), (3) and (13) were taken into consideration. Ms. Barron moved to renew the certificate(s) to dispense. Seconded by Mr. Micuda. Motion carried 5 Ayes, 1 Absent, 1 recused.

(4) Dr. Bruce Sadilek; Renewal of Certificate to Dispense.

Dr. Sadilek recused himself. Agenda item B (4) was taken into consideration. Dr. Rubin made a motion to renew the certificate. Seconded by Mr. Micuda. Motion carried 5 Ayes, 1 Absent, 1 Recused.

(5) Dr. Renee Waldman; Renewal of Certificate to Dispense.

Dr. Waldman recused herself. Agenda item B (5) was taken into consideration. Dr. Rubin made a motion to renew the certificate. Seconded by Dr. Walker. Motion carried 5 Ayes, 1 Absent, 1 Recused.

(6) Dr. Dan Rubin; Renewal of Certificate to Dispense.

(7) Dr. Debi Smolinski; Renewal of Certificate to Dispense, works with Dr. Rubin

(8) Dr. Melissa Coats; Renewal of Certificate to Dispense, works with Dr. Rubin

(9) Dr. Heather Paulson; Renewal of Certificate to Dispense, works with Dr. Rubin

(10) Dr. Leila Turner; Renewal of Certificate to Dispense, works with Dr. Rubin.

Dr. Rubin recused himself. Agenda item(s) B (6), (7), (8), (9), (10) were taken in consideration. Mr. Micuda moved to renew the certificate(s). Seconded by Dr. Walker. Motion carried 5 Ayes, 1 Absent, 1 Recused.

(11) Dr. Sam Walters, Renewal of Certificate to Dispense. Open Cases.

(12) Dr. Brendan McCarthy, Renewal of Certificate to Dispense. Open Case

Agenda item(s) B (11), (12) were taken into consideration. Dr. Rubin moved to issue the certificate(s) without prejudice to any ongoing case(s) and without waiving jurisdiction to any matter pending before the Board.

5. Discussion and Consideration of Correspondence and Questions for the Board. The Board may go into executive session regarding this matter.

(A) Notice regarding naturopathic physicians ability to sign death certificates.

No Action Required.

ADJOURNMENT; THE BOARD ADJOURNED AT 3:07 PM.

ARIZONA NATUROPATHIC PHYSICIANS MEDICAL BOARD

DATE