



State Of Arizona
Naturopathic Physicians Medical Board

"Protecting the Public's Health"

1400 West Washington • Suite 300 • Phoenix, AZ 85007 • Telephone 602-542-8242 • FAX 602-542-8804
Website www.aznd.gov
TTY for Americans with Disability 800-367-8939 • Disability Voice Relay 800-842-4681

Janice K. Brewer – Governor

Catherine Walker, NMD. - Chair • Daniel Rubin, ND– Vice Chair • Mr. Evan Zang - Secretary/Treasurer
Mr. Kip Micuda JD - Public Member • Renee Waldman, NMD – Physician Member
Ms. Linda Barron, Public Member • Dr. Bruce Sadilek, NMD – Physician Member
Craig Runbeck, ND – Executive Director

MINUTES
BOARD MEETING

Thursday January 14, 2010 • 1:00 p.m. • Basement Conference Room B-1
1400 West Washington • Phoenix, AZ 85007

1. Call to Order by Presiding Officer

- A. Roll call of Board members and establishment of a quorum to conduct meeting.
The meeting was called to order at 1:00 PM. Roll Call: Dr. Walker, Present; Dr. Sadilek, Present; Mr. Micuda, Present; Dr. Waldman, Present; Dr. Sadilek, Present. Mr. Zang Present via phone.
6 Present, 2 Absent.
Ms. Barron joined the meeting at 1: 05 PM
Dr. Rubin joined the meeting at 1:15 PM.
B. Acknowledgement of presence of Board staff and legal counsel.
Present were Dr. Craig Runbeck, Executive Director; Ms. Elizabeth Campbell, Assistant Attorney General; Ms Gail Anthony, Deputy Director.

2. Call to the Public

No requests to address the Board were received.

3. Discussion, Consideration, Possible Action by the Board of Consent Agenda

- A. Discussion, Consideration, Possible Decision and Vote by Board of Minutes of November 12, 2009
The Board approved the board meeting minutes of November 12, 2009.
B. ED. Report
No action required by the Board.
C. Discussion, Consideration, Possible Action by the Board of Medical License(s) / Examination Application
Susan Williams
The Board approved the issuance of license(s) by examination.
D. Discussion, Consideration, Possible Action by the Board of Medical License(s) / Endorsement
Melissa Gastellum Clement Lee
The Board approved the issuance of license(s) by endorsement..

E. **Discussion, Consideration, Possible Action by the Board of Application(s) for Renewal of Medical License**

Angela Wojtowicz	Danya Epstein
Kathleen Dang	Nicole Barreda
Carlie Bell	John Hinze
Barbara Marsh-Jones	Katerina Novakova
Erin Fitzgerald	Elaine Burns
Rachel Rhodes	Robin Terranella
Larry Abel	Eric Bower
Sharon Stills	Natalie Ham
Cheryl Kasdorf	Robin Borsa
Stephanie Pina	Jason mneil
Paul Anderson	Tabish Malik
Laryn Callaway	Judy Hinojosa-Sinks
Randy Spicer	Linda Oksman
Matthew Cavaiola	Erika McKeen
Nael Dagstani	Christina Kovalik
Lauren Pilgren	Carol Jamison
Sheldon Deal	Anna K. Cascio
Melenie Dunn	Lisa Amerine
Maria Bell	Roxie Strand
Raushanah Najeeullah	Edward Shabezd
Donese Worden	Peggy Maxwell
Nathan Vitaro	Jessica Tran
Jeffrey Lee	Jessica Anderson-McLaughlin
Christian Armanti	Yvonne Skinner
Mark James	Emily Keranen
Nick Buratovich	MaryJo Watkins
Andrea Spira-O'Connor	Tam Spat
Mark Strom	Barbara Koudelka
Shauna Birdsall	Timothy Birdsall
Brandy Pierce	Jeffrey Sager
June Stevens	Christy Cline
M. Ann Murray	Chad Goetz
Linda Lambert	Maureen Wilson Hwang
Laurinda Kwan	Robert Myers
James Hutton	Cristina Rombero-Bosch
Alicia Miller	Carol McCalment
Jo Turner	Tiffany Binder
Meghana Thanki	Kathryn Sage
Cathy Forbes	Krystal Tellier
Michael Uzick	Barbara Berens Oxley
Kareen O'Brien	Wendy Wells
Valeria Birch	Dana Myatt
Mona Morstein	Valerita Breiten
Clinton McJunkin	Leah Anderson
Ann Lovick	Summer Swanick
Patricia Herman	Wallace, Norman
Maureen Schwehr	Carrie Rittling
Susan Calimeri	Joanne Feaster
Adam Kerievsky	Louise Gutowski
Thomas Frank	Laurie Moody
Eric Udell	Dana Keaton

Kenneth Lashutka	Patricia Beck
Mary Ellen O'Brien	Laura Kennedy
Chriselda Beltran	Elizabeth Grady
Meghna Thacker	Dawn Eller
LoRal Linton	Albert Chavez
Ardeschir Mehrabani	Stephanie Stark
Anita Larrow	Mario Howell
Philip Grasso	Michelle Thatcher
Matthew Baral	Monique Lai
David Cramer	Alexander Coracides
Dino Sainati	Karsten Alexandria
Bonnie Wick	Joel Morgan
Jillian Finker	Julie Keiffer
Mary Marcantel	Damien Brandeis
Melinda Whitsell	Lutea Saldivar
Danite Haller	Sima Aidun
Eric Hampton	Linda Ferguson
Kiera Smialek	Adrienne Borg
Jennifer Gentry	Dianna Heath
Kristen Fujii	John Eldridge
Lezlie Link	Rebecca Carpenter
Vance Inouye	Anne Marie Fine
Yezid Callejas	Robb Bird
Jose Ortiz	Jeffery Knytych
Lori Barnes	Laura Lambert
John Imundo	Margot Longenecker
Robert Upchurch	Tursha Hamilton
F. Debbie Jacques	Jeni Keilty
Julie Stears	Karlee Heffner
Shana Spector Deneen	Barbara Dapcic
Kristen Berkner	Wayne Black
Hope Farner	Michael Chung
Jennifer Nevels	Dora Muttart
Autumn Holder	Christina Compton
Janice Skelton	Marcos de Escobar
Stephanie Eastman	John Hawrylak
Nicole Antonucci Taylor	James Reagan
Rebecca Cooke	Dawn Bantel
Andrea Weiner	Herbert Schuck
Teresa Vesco	Donald Baker
Alice Alibrio	Allison Pritchard
Margie Simmons-Stubber	Jody Krukowski
Miriam Peachy	Delores D'Aprile
Kimberly Engard	Ross Kerievsky
Amira Ahdut	Lance Morris
Robert Morrissey	Yuko Takeda
Ravi Chandiramani	Barbara Ezrre
Karen Vaughan	Julie Gorman
Jennifer Dye	Suneil Jain
Paul Stallone	Philip Wazny
Diane Hawk	Scott Jamison
S. Ross Dunbar	Anna Nordin
Marie Santora	Amanda Frick

Kathleen McCaleb	Nicole King
James Witman	Chad Schroer
Ann Seipt	Barbara Brooks
Steve Nenninger	Francesca Quinn
Sibongile Mnguni	Theresa Ramsey
Sara Bedell Cook	Kristen O'Rourke
Peggy McGarey	Nancy Mullis
Shannon York	Kimberly Williford
Paula Triplett-Foss	Aralan Cage
Charles Wilkinson	Ryan Krch
Laura Sickels	Mark Dietzgen
Sonal Patel	Frank Sweet
Mariam Malek	Lindsey Pearson
Apryl Krause	Joseph Brown
Allison McDaniel	Kristy Anderson
Jill Hoffman	Eric Cerre
Laree Hooker	Jaime Ewald
Matthew Mitchell	Elizabeth Rice
Leslie Marcum	Jonathan Powell
E. Friederike Doak	Andrew Kaufmann
Susan Whiting	David Daily
James Pendleton	David Arneson
Laura Boe	Betty Yurgel
Susanne Macsay	Diana Buehler
Karen D;Huyvetter	Tracy Magerus
Ken Blackman	Theo Christodoulakis
Garrett Smith	Kyle Neeley
Katherine Raymer	DeAnna Woeller
Nita Champion	Nate Champion
Miriam Gilbert	Dejarra Sims
Jessica Bramstedt	Stacy Riseborough
Ralph Potter	Timothy Visser
Tracy Wooten	Yu-Ree Hyun
Rhonda Steinke	Denette King
Timothy Peace	Lawrence Caprio
Daniela Hutyrova	Annette D'Armata
Shelly S. Weisman	Sandra Colvard
Marie Niechwiadowicz	Taylor Arbour
Aimee Bachelier	Michele Caragiulo
Sara Rodgers	Michelle Michael
Mia Darling	David Hagen
Margarita Guzman	Anesia Groves
Sarv Varta Khalsa	Timothy Schwaiger
Mario Calaburri	Ty Tallman
Margaret Husami	Thomas Jamison
Steven Ehrlich	Grant McKernan
Beth Poindexter	Michelle Mossell
Cheryl Johnson	Cori Kennedy
Andria Orlovski	Carlos Santo
Deborah Vacik	Miriam Weber
Tara Peyman	Kimberly Landino
LanceHering	Sabine Garrett
Gilbert Alvarado	Brendan McCarthy

MaryK Geyer	Patricia Gaines
Tiffany Mitchell	Susan Godman
Wendy Wang	Denise Grobe
Tue Truong	Brandon Chastant
Richard Hodge	Katrina Steinberger
Cheryl Sly	Patricia Pringel
Victoria Green	Laura Mittman
Emmanouil Karampahtsis	Wayne Spence
Heather Wdowin	Bryan McConnell
Alan Rader	Alexander de Soler
Leslie Axelrod	Nancy Robins
Marianna Fisher	Heidi Koerner
Amy O'Hara	Kelly Crinnion
Charmonique Tims	Walter Crinnion
Kenneth Proefrock	William Nelson
Judy Hiell	Jean-Lu LeProvost
Robert Gear	Shanna Tobar
William Troutt	Valerie Olmsted
Lisa Richardson	Rebekkah Sax
Henry Ealy	Christina Tondora
Angela Bilyeu	Jennifer Kaymeyer
Jennifer Mundt	Yashpal Jayne
Murray Dowell	Irina Riabikina
Susan Hawkins	Dorothy Karcheski
Karen Van Der Veer	Karen Willfahrt
Jessica Curcio	Mark Rudderham
Shawn Joyner	Susan Rudderham
Valerie Nix	Keith Chambers
Todd Smith	Susan Williams
Ramon Esquerdo	Lahari Wikramanayake
Glenn Ozalan	Julie George
Inge Barth	Susan Wojcik
Kathryn Cameron	Anne Palzer
Judith Hones	Becky Tanner
Sara Hazel	Veronique Pangia Kerr
Teri Davis	Noemi Quintanar
Robert Ellsworth	Vanessa Edwards
Chrystie Eggerling	James Sheehan
James Tuggle	Benjamin Zorensky
Alison Redwine	Lisa Maturo
Amy-Jane Lilie	Ave' Sims
David Tallman	Susan Stratton
Jason Porter	Bianca Munoz
Erica Middlemiss	Edward Geller
Lawrence Helms, Jr.	Christie Yerby
Tara Swartz	Michelle Turcotte
Cho Long Elizabeth Kim	John Hartman
Thomas Lee	Jami Kupperman
Lisa Hilli	Robert Streisfeld
Heather Yarbrough	Candice Jackson
Fred Arnold	Teresa McBride
Michael Berke	Erica Campbell
Jeannine Maschek	Stephanie Gajus

Orville Weyrich	Kenna Barber
Kimberly Volk	Bruce Scher
Heather Moroso	Linda Kim
Cheryl Larson	Sandra Olic
Sara LaRoche	Emily Davenport
Sherdeen Graham	Frances March
JoAnn Yanez	David Craig
Andrea Purcell	Filiberto Flores
Jennifer Ball	Alan Van-Putten – Laguerre
Jeanette Gallagher	Brandie Gowey
Eli Ber	Jonathan Psenka
Allen Anderson	Lewis Underwood
Kevon Arthurs	Gladys Ceballos-Logan
Yolanda Rodriquez	Michael DiPalma
Christine Sorensen	John Dye
Randall Robinson	Tara hickman
Rebecca Ford	Gilberto Leon
Tiffany Weeks	Deborah Ardolf
Melissa Dengler	Patricia Johnson
Natalie Wiggins	Markin Babij
Jacqueline Carboni	

The Board approved the issuance of the renewed medical license(s).

**F. Discussion, Consideration, Possible Action by the Board of Application(s) / Request(s) to Retire Medical License**

Dawn Eller	Alexis Brereton
Konrad Kail	Eric Wood
Agostino Diroma	Natasha Ryan

The Board approved the retirement of medical license(s).

**G. Discussion, Consideration, Possible Action by the Board of Application(s) for Certificate to Dispense (initial)**

Deborah Ardolf	Erin Fitzgerald
Raushanah Najeeullah	Julie George
Keith Chambers	Lauren Pihlgren
Ahdut, Amira	Jason McNeil
Margot Longenecker	Tiffany Mitchell
John Eldridge (reinstatement)	Donald Baker (reinstatement)
Miriam Peachy	Robert Morrissey (reinstatement)
Shannon York (reinstatement)	Emily Keranen
Marie Niechwiadowicz	Margarita Guzman
Taylor Arbour	Cori Kennedy
Jean-Luc LeProvost	Judith Jones

The Board approved the issuance of certificate(s) to dispense.

**H. Discussion, Consideration, Possible Action by the Board of Application(s) for Certificate to Engage in a Clinical Training Program**

Judith Ziol	Chris Deszynsky
Dane Buzbaum	Corey Skinbisz
Sean Scheses	Nanao Takaki

Analiah Patrice	Eric Lopez
Krysine Nguyen	Monica Vaghela
Taylor Hill	Teresita Barrantes
Sally Burgess	Hadassah Hilewitz
Alanna Harrison	La Deana Jeane
Laura Munro	Shabnam Saran
Melissa Highes	Lynnette Balentine
Andrea Hillstad	Heather Wojslaw
Angela Darragh	Carmel Ferreiran
Joshua Chrystal	Luann Cullen
Sana Eang	Maria Helioti
Carolyn Thomason	Scott Just
Carolyn Stone	John Oertle
Daniel Warren	Esti Bakty
Isabel Sharkar	Kira Morrill
Ephraim Crocker	

The Board approved the issuance of the certificate(s) for clinical training.

**I. Discussion, Consideration, Possible Action by the Board of Application(s) for Renewal of Certificate to Engage in a Clinical Training Program**

Jenn Botham	Adrienne Stewart
Susan Lundgren	Rebecca Whelchel

The Board approved the renewal of certificate(s) for clinical training.

Ms. Barron joined the meeting prior to the vote.

**Consent Agenda vote: Mr. Micuda moved to accept the consent agenda, items (3) A, C, D, E, F, G, H, and I. Second by Dr. Sadilek. Motion carried 6 Present 1 Absent.**

Dr. Rubin joined the meeting at this time.

**4. Regulatory Matters**

**A. Discussion, Consideration, Possible Action by the Board of Investigations and Complaints. The Board may go into executive session regarding this matter.**

**(1) Dr. Kirk Slagel, Case No. 10-005 Formal Hearing.**

Dr. Slagel was present. Ms. Campbell, A.A.G. represented the State. Mr. Munns, A.A.G. was present, representing the Board. Ms. Gail Anthony testified as a witness for the State. Dr. Slagel requested and was afforded the opportunity to make copies of evidence he wished to present to the Board, but had not prepared prior to the Board meeting.

The Board moved on to item 4 (A) 4 on the agenda, during this time.

After completion of review and vote of Item 4 A (4), the Board resumed consideration of item 4 A (1).

After discussion and consideration by the Board, Dr Rubin made a motion to adopt the findings of fact; as presented, with the exception of amending the language in item 3, by removing the words “failed to be” and inserting the words “was not”. Seconded by Ms. Barron. Motion carried 7 Ayes.

After discussion and consideration by the Board, Ms. Barron made a motion to adopt the Conclusion of Law, as presented. Seconded by Dr. Rubin. Motion carried 7 Ayes.

Mr. Zang and Mr. Micuda left the meeting prior to the following vote.

After discussion and consideration by the Board, Dr. Walker made a motion to suspend Dr. Slagel’s

medical license whereby the terms of probation under the existing consent agreement will be placed on hold. Suspension of the license will remain until he has completed a re-evaluation with a Board approved evaluator and the report has been submitted to the Board for review and approval. If the Board approves the reinstatement of his medical license at some point in the future, the terms of the existing probation will resume for the remaining time left as stated under the terms of probation. Roll Call: Dr. Sadilek, Abstained; Ms. Barron, Aye; Dr. Waldman, Aye; Dr. Rubin, Aye; Dr. Walker, Aye. 4 Ayes 1 Abstention., 2 Absent.

**(2) Dr. Carole Eastman, Consideration and Possible Action on Consent Agreement for Surrender of Medical license. This matter was taken out of order as item 1.**

Dr. Eastman was present and addressed the Board. After discussion and consideration by the Board, Ms. Barron made a motion to accept the consent agreement for licensure surrender. Second by Mr. Micuda. Roll Call: Dr. Sadilek, Aye; Ms. Barron, Aye; Dr. Waldman, Abstain; Mr. Zang, Aye; Mr. Micuda, Aye. Dr. Walker, Aye. Motion Carried 5 Ayes, 1 Abstention, 1 Absent.

**(3) Dr. Gioacchino Franco, Case No. 06-032, 08-001 and 09-057. Consideration and Possible Action on Consent Agreement.**

Dr. Rubin recused himself. After discussion and consideration by the Board, Ms. Barron made a motion to accept the consent agreement. Second by Dr. Sadilek. Roll Call: Dr. Waldman, Aye; Ms. Barron, Aye; Dr. Sadilek., Aye; Dr. Walker, Aye. 4 Ayes, 1 Recused, 2 Absent.

**(4) Dr. Eric Udell, Case No. 10-003. Investigative Interview.**

**This item was taken into consideration by the Board out of order.**

Dr. Udell was present with Counsel Ms. Carole M. Romano, made statements to the Board and answered questions. The complainant was present and made statements to the Board. After review and consideration, Dr. Rubin made a motion to dismiss the complaint. Second by Dr. Waldman. Motion carried 7 Ayes.

**(5) Dr. Eric Hampton. Petition of Termination of Probation. This item was taken out of order after the conclusion of item 4 (A) 1**

Dr. Hampton was present and made statements and answered questions. After discussion and consideration by the Board, Dr. Rubin made a motion to approve the termination of probation. Second by Ms. Barron. Motion carried 5 Ayes. 2 Absent.

**B. Discussion, Consideration, Possible Action by the Board of Persons Applying for Renewal of Medical License. The Board may go into executive session regarding this matter.**

**(1) Dr. Gioacchino Franco, Open Investigations** After discussion and consideration by the Board, Dr. Rubin made a motion to approve the licensure renewal. Second by Dr. Waldman. Motion carried 5 Ayes, 2 Absent.

**(2) Dr. Bruce Sadilek.** Dr. Sadilek recused himself. After discussion and consideration by the Board, Dr. Rubin made a motion to approve the licensure renewal. Second by Dr. Waldman. Motion carried 4 Ayes, 1 Recused, 2 Absent.

**(3) Dr. Heather Paulson, Works with Dr. Rubin**

**(4) Dr. Melissa Coats, Works with Dr. Rubin**

**(5) Dr. Debora Smolinski, Work with Dr. Rubin**

**(6) Dr. Dan Rubin**

**(7) Dr. Leila Turner, Works with Dr. Rubin**

Items 3-7 were taken into consideration together. Dr. Rubin recused himself. After discussion and consideration by the Board, Dr. Sadilek made a motion to approve the licensure renewal(s). Second by Ms. Barron. Motion carried 4 Ayes, 1 Recused, 2 Absent.

**(8) Dr. Catherine Walker**



**(9) Dr. Samuel Walker**

**(10) Dr. Tamara Torres, Works with Dr. Walker**

Items 8-10 were taken into consideration together.

Dr. Walker recused herself. After discussion and consideration by the Board Dr. Sadilek made a motion to approve the licensure renewal(s). Second by Dr. Waldman. Motion carried 4 Ayes, 1 Recused, 2 Absent.

**(11) Dr. Sam Walters Open Investigations**

**(12) Dr. Jennifer Burns, Open Investigations**

Items 11 and 12 were taken into consideration by the Board together. After discussion and consideration by the Board, Dr. Rubin made a motion to approve the licensure renewal(s). Second by Ms. Barron. Motion carried 5 Ayes, 2 Absent.

**(13) Dr. Renee Waldman**

Dr. Waldman recused herself. After discussion and consideration by the Board, Dr. Rubin made a motion to approve the licensure renewal. Second by Ms. Barron. Motion carried 4 Ayes, 1 Recused, 2 Absent.

**(14) Dr. Carole Eastman**

After discussion and consideration by the Board, Dr. Rubin made a motion to allow for the withdrawal of the medical license renewal. Second by Dr. Sadilek. Motion carried 5 Ayes. 2 Absent.

- 5. Discussion, Consideration, Possible Action by the Board on Election of Board Officers. The Board may go into executive session regarding this matter.** After discussion and consideration, the Board agreed to keep the Board Officers for 2010 the same as they were for 2009.

**ADJOURNMENT: THE BOARD WAS ADJOURNED AT 5:00 PM**

---

ARIZONA NATUROPATHIC PHYSICIANS MEDICAL BOARD

---

DATE