



State of Arizona Naturopathic Physicians Medical Board

“Protecting the Public’s Health”

1400 West Washington • Suite 230 • Phoenix, AZ 85007 • Telephone 602-542-8242 • FAX 602-542-3093

Website www.aznd.gov

TTY for Americans with Disability 800-367-8939 • Disability Voice Relay 800-842-4681

Douglas A. Ducey – Governor

Dr. Bruce Sadilek, ND – Chair • Dr. Marianne Marchese, ND – Vice Chair • Dr. Amy Terlisner, ND– Secretary/Treasurer,
Dr. John Eldridge, NMD– Physician Member - Herbert W. Kalish - Public Member,
Jamie N. Bennett - Public Member, Karen Tibbitts- Public Member

MINUTES

BOARD MEETING

**Thursday, October 13, 2016 • 1:00 p.m. • Basement Conference Room B-1
1400 West Washington • Phoenix, AZ 85007**

1. CALL TO ORDER BY PRESIDING OFFICER

THE MEETING WAS CALLED TO ORDER AT 1:05 PM.

A. Roll call of Board members and establishment of a quorum to conduct meetings.

		SADILEK Chair	MARCHESE Vice Chair	TERLISNER Sec./Tres.	ELDRIDGE	KALISH	BENNETT	TIBBITTS
Present	5	x		x	x		x via phone	x via phone
Absent	2		x			x		

B. Acknowledgement of presence of Board staff and legal counsel.

Present were Ms. Sabrina Kahn, Assistant Attorney General, Mr. John Tellier, Assistant Attorney General, and Ms. Gail Anthony, Executive Director.

2. DECLARATION OF CONFLICTS OF INTEREST

NONE DECLARED

3. CIVILITY STATEMENT

Dr. Sadilek read the Civility Statement.

In accordance with the Open Meeting Law, the Board has a civility policy that prohibits any type of disorderly conduct that disrupts the Board from carrying out its business. Those violating this policy will be asked to modify their behavior and act civilly. If the disorderly conduct continues, the person may be removed from the meeting room. (Adopted 11/8/2012).

4. REVIEW, CONSIDERATION, AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING APPROVAL OF THE BOARD MEETING MINUTES.

A. Regular Board Meeting Minutes of September 8, 2016.

Ms. Bennett requested a change be made to the minutes draft on item 5E to reflect her present and voting. Dr. Terlisner made a motion to approve the minutes with the requested change. Seconded by Dr. Sadilek. Motion Carried 5 Ayes, 2 Absent.

	VOTE	SADILEK Chair	MARCHESE Vice Chair	TERLISNER Sec. /Tres.	ELDRIDGE	KALISH	BENNETT	TIBBITTS
Yes	5	x		x	x		x	x
No								
Abstain								
Absent	2		x			x		
Recused								

5. CONSENT AGENDA – REVIEW, CONSIDERATION, AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING APPROVAL OF THE FOLLOWING APPLICATIONS.

The Consent Agenda items should be considered for approval as a single action unless a Board Member wishes to remove the item for review. The Board may vote to go into Executive Session pursuant to A.R.S. § 32-431.03(A)(2) (to discuss confidential information) or A.R.S. § 38-431.03(A)(3) (to receive legal advice).

A. Naturopathic Medical License by Examination

- Balduzzi, Anthony
- Banker, Rosanna
- Barraza, Michelle
- Briante, Carla
- Butner, Lana
- Cummins, Emy
- Dean, Bridget
- Despotides, Bianca
- Dickerson, Wendy (temporary license issued in accordance with A.R.S. § 32-1522.01)
- Dragg, Darlyn (temporary license issued in accordance with A.R.S. § 32-1522.01)
- Gaston, Clark
- Gliniecki, Michele
- Griffith, Brandi (temporary license issued in accordance with A.R.S. § 32-1522.01)
- Hoang, Melanie (temporary license issued in accordance with A.R.S. § 32-1522.01)
- Hummel, Michael
- Jonas, Mary (temporary license issued in accordance with A.R.S. § 32-1522.01)
- Kennedy, Shawn (temporary license issued in accordance with A.R.S. § 32-1522.01)
- Maxwell, Erin
- Mowery, Travis
- Overbeck, Jennifer
- Pagano, Taylor
- Parent, Daina
- Pettitt, Michelle
- Poteet, Zachary
- Regino, Gabriela
- Richards, Calvin
- Robins, Jade
- Romero, Kelly
- Ruiz, Vanessa
- Salisbury, Lauren (temporary license issued in accordance with A.R.S. § 32-1522.01)
- Smithers, Jillian
- Sowards, Dustin
- Tenney, Michelle

Valentin, Ann
Vaughn, Kimara (temporary license issued in accordance with A.R.S. § 32-1522.01)
Wallace, Kristine (temporary license issued in accordance with A.R.S. § 32-1522.01)
Washington, Lina

B. Naturopathic Medical License by Endorsement

Andrew Allshouse, currently licensed in Washington and Oregon, no Acupuncture
(temporary license issued in accordance with A.R.S. § 32-1522.01)
Melissa Gibbons, currently licensed in Washington, no Acupuncture

C. Naturopathic Medical License Renewal

Brandeis, Damien
Rogalla, Deborah

D. Initial Certificate to Dispense

Hoang, Melanie
Hummel, Michael
Jonas, Mary
Kennedy, Shaun
Kwiatkowski, Laura
Price, Tess
Schwaiger, Timothy
Werner, Stephanie

E. Initial Certificate to Engage in Preceptorship Training

Chand, Vassundhra
Desportides, Bianca
Kaplan, Steven
Mittman, Arie
Shulman, Kahtryn
Smithers, Jilliam

F. Initial Certificate to Conduct Preceptorship Training

Dr. Brent Cameron
Dr. Steven Sorr
Dr. Bridget Walsh

G. Renewal Certificate to Engage in Preceptorship Training

Chand, Vassundhra

H. Renewal Certificate to Conduct Preceptorship Training

Dr. Jarom Ipson
Dr. Bridget Walsh

I. Initial Certificate to Engage in a Clinical Training Program

Dannawi, Aden
Ramtahal, Alexandria
Schumann, Courtney

J. Renewal Certificate to Engage in a Clinical Training Program

Arnold, Kenya
Bennett, Sarah
Colon, Andrea
Douglas, Khadija
Franklin, Jameelah
Hough, John

Jatta, Ebrahim
 Johnston, Warwick
 Lara, Ana
 Lima, Paula
 Martin, Raquel
 Pannu, Neelamjeet
 Riaz, Samar
 Shannon, Jillian
 Shell, Sarah
 Spurgeon, James
 Tate, Keshia
 Wayne, Emilee
 White, Iasha
 Whitten, Aaron
 Wilder, Cassandra
 Garcia, Victoria
 Bennett, Shannon
 Moreno, Celaine
 Nguyen, Kensive

CONSENT AGENDA VOTE: Dr. Terlisner made a motion to approve items 5 A - J. Seconded by Dr. Sadilek. Motion Carried 5 Ayes, 2 Absent.

	VOTE	SADILEK Chair	MARCHESE Vice Chair	TERLISNER Sec. /Tres.	ELDRIDGE	KALISH	BENNETT	TIBBITTS
Yes	5	x		x	x		x	x
No								
Abstain								
Absent	2		x			x		
Recused								

6. REVIEW, CONSIDERATION, AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING THE FOLLOWING INVESTIGATIVE INTERVIEWS AND CONSENT AGREEMENT.

The Board may vote to go into Executive Session pursuant to A.R.S. § 32-431.03(A)(2) (to discuss confidential information) or A.R.S. § 38-431.03(A)(3) (to receive legal advice).

A. Dr. Jordan Kopcio, Case No. 15-025 – Consent Agreement

Dr. Kopcio was present along with his Attorney Ms. Claudia Horan. Ms. Sabrina Khan, Assistant Attorney General, represented the State of Arizona in this case. Mr. John Tellier, Assistant Attorney General; represented the Board in this case. Ms. Kahn made gave a brief history regarding the case timeline of events and gave an overview of the agreement. Ms. Horan stated her client had reviewed and signed the agreement. Dr. Terlisner made a motion to approve the consent agreement. Seconded by Dr. Sadilek. Roll Call Vote: Motion Carried 5 Ayes, 2 Absent.

	VOTE	SADILEK Chair	MARCHESE Vice Chair	TERLISNER Sec. /Tres.	ELDRIDGE	KALISH	BENNETT	TIBBITTS
Yes	5	x		x	x		x	x
No								
Abstain								
Absent	2		x			x		
Recused								

B. Dr. Debora Chelson, Case No. 16-057 – Investigative Interview

Dr. Chelson was present. Dr. Sadilek asked her to explain her rationale for the prescriptions written for the patient. She stated the patient had been referred to another physician, and the prescriptions were written for the interim, until the patient was seen. Dr. Terlisner pointed out that in situations when the patient may be non complaint and refusing appropriate care, it is appropriate to simply refer them to other sources for full treatment, instead of offering partial care. Dr. Chelson confirmed she failed to renew her certificate to dispense and had written some prescriptions while it was not current. Dr. Terlisner clarified that Dr. Chelson could not prescribe until she obtains a current certificate to dispense. Dr. Terlisner made a motion to issue a Letter of Concern regarding appropriate prescribing and failing to maintain a current certificate to dispense while writing prescriptions. Further, an order for 10 hour of non-disciplinary pharmacology is issued. Seconded by Dr. Eldridge. Roll Call Vote: Motion Carried 5 Ayes, 2 Absent.

	VOTE	SADILEK Chair	MARCHESE Vice Chair	TERLISNER Sec. /Tres.	ELDRIDGE	KALISH	BENNETT	TIBBITTS
Yes	5	x		x	x		x	x
No								
Abstain								
Absent	2		x			x		
Recused								

C. Dr. Isaac Youseff, Case No. 16-048 – Investigative Interview

Dr. Youseff was present. The complaint was received from a person living out of State, who claimed to have sent her records to the previous owner of the clinic; who is now deceased. The complainant requested return of her records, however Dr. Youseff could not locate records pertaining to her on the premises. The complainant made several calls to the office, demanding return of the records, even after it had been explained no records could be located. Dr. Youseff stated during one of the phone calls, his receptionist mentioned a homeopathic remedy to the complainant and he had mentioned he "suspected" she had an adrenal issue, and offered to send her a testing kit. But that he never did send the kit and she was never his patient. Dr. Terlisner stated he should train staff that all health related questions are to be forwarded to you, and that by offering to send a testing kit, there was an implied responsibility. In the future, he needs to be mindful to never offer services without establishing the doctor patient relationship prior. Dr. Sadilek made a motion to dismiss the case. Seconded by Dr. Eldridge. Motion Carried 5 Ayes, 2 Absent.

	VOTE	SADILEK Chair	MARCHESE Vice Chair	TERLISNER Sec. /Tres.	ELDRIDGE	KALISH	BENNETT	TIBBITTS
Yes	5	x		x	x		x	x
No								
Abstain								
Absent	2		x			x		
Recused								

D. Dr. Mary Reker, Case No. 16-051 – Investigative Interview

Dr. Reker was present. She stated she understands the mistake she made in prescribing a medication that is not within scope. Dr. Terlisner stated she wanted Dr. Reker to understand that just because a patient presents already taking a certain medication, the physician is not obligated to refill it. The physician has every right to say no to refilling or prescribing a medication to a patient, and to know when to refer the patient to a pain specialists. Dr. Eldridge stated there are other medications under scope, and other options which can be used to treat pain. Dr. Sadilek stated if she is writing a controlled drug, she needs to check the PMP prior, document why she is prescribing it, what the plan is to taper down and the goal. Dr. Sadilek made a motion to issue an order for 10 hours of additional CME in pharmacology and pain management and a Letter of Concern for writing out of scope prescriptions. Seconded by Dr. Terlisner. Roll Call Vote: 5 Ayes, 2 Absent.

	VOTE	SADILEK Chair	MARCHESE Vice Chair	TERLISNER Sec. /Tres.	ELDRIDGE	KALISH	BENNETT	TIBBITTS
Yes	5	x		x	x		x	x
No								
Abstain								
Absent	2		x			x		
Recused								

7. REVIEW, CONSIDERATION, AND POSSIBLE ACTION ON APPLICATIONS.

A. Joshua Reilly, Application for Preceptorship Training

Applicant was present. He provided information to the Board of completion of all court orders related to the reported incident from 2012. Dr. Sadilek made a motion to approve the application. Seconded by Dr. Terlisner. Motion Carried 5 Ayes, 2 Absent.

	VOTE	SADILEK Chair	MARCHESE Vice Chair	TERLISNER Sec. /Tres.	ELDRIDGE	KALISH	BENNETT	TIBBITTS
Yes	5	x		x	x		x	x
No								
Abstain								
Absent	2		x			x		
Recused								

B. Stephanie Bailey, Application for Naturopathic Medical License

Applicant attended via phone. She answered questions regarding the circumstances surrounding the 2015 disorderly conduct charge. Ms. Tibbits made a motion to approve the application. Seconded by Dr. Eldridge. Motion Carried 5 Ayes, 2 Absent.

	VOTE	SADILEK Chair	MARCHESE Vice Chair	TERLISNER Sec. /Tres.	ELDRIDGE	KALISH	BENNETT	TIBBITTS
Yes	5	x		x	x		x	x
No								
Abstain								
Absent	2		x			x		
Recused								

C. Travis Whitney, Application for Naturopathic Medical License

The Board discussed the facts as disclosed on the application, surrounding the circumstances of the charge from when applicant was a minor. Ms. Bennett made a motion to approve the application. Seconded by Dr. Eldridge. Motion Carried 5 Ayes, 2 Absent.

	VOTE	SADILEK Chair	MARCHESE Vice Chair	TERLISNER Sec. /Tres.	ELDRIDGE	KALISH	BENNETT	TIBBITTS
Yes	5	x		x	x		x	x
No								
Abstain								
Absent	2		x			x		
Recused								

D. Kayla Sumberg, Application for Naturopathic Medical License

Applicant was present and answered questions about the 2016 charge for failure to obey a police officer. She stated she didn't think about her obligation to listen to the police officer and sit down. If she had it to do over, she would have done everything differently and done what she had been told. Dr. Sadilek made a motion to approve the application. Seconded by Dr. Eldridge. Motion Carried 5 Ayes, 2 Absent.

	VOTE	SADILEK Chair	MARCHESE Vice Chair	TERLISNER Sec. /Tres.	ELDRIDGE	KALISH	BENNETT	TIBBITTS
Yes	5	x		x	x		x	x
No								
Abstain								
Absent	2		x			x		

Recused								
---------	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--

- E. Amoz Van Dyke, Application for Naturopathic Medical License
 Applicant was present and answered questions surrounding the disclosed 1993 curfew charge. Dr. Sadilek made a motion to approve the application. Seconded by Dr. Terlisner. Motion Carried 5 Ayes, 2 Absent.

	VOTE	SADILEK Chair	MARCHESE Vice Chair	TERLISNER Sec. /Tres.	ELDRIDGE	KALISH	BENNETT	TIBBITTS
Yes	5	x		x	x		x	x
No								
Abstain								
Absent	2		x			x		
Recused								

8. REVIEW, CONSIDERATION, AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING WHETHER TO TERMINATE PROBATION AND APPROVE APPLICATION FOR A NATUROPATHIC MEDICAL LICENSE FOR MARIA CERVIGNI.

The Applicant was present. The Executive Director of the Board stated that the Applicant has been in complete compliance with her order during her probation period. Applicant stated she is doing well and continues with a strong support system. Dr. Sadilek made a motion to approve the application for medical license to include termination of probation. Seconded by Dr. Terlisner. Motion Carried 5 Ayes, 2 Absent.

	VOTE	SADILEK Chair	MARCHESE Vice Chair	TERLISNER Sec. /Tres.	ELDRIDGE	KALISH	BENNETT	TIBBITTS
Yes	5	x		x	x		x	x
No								
Abstain								
Absent	2		x			x		
Recused								

9. REVIEW, CONSIDERATION, AND POSSIBLE ACTION TO RESCIND THE APPROVAL OF CLEMENT LEE'S REINSTATEMENT OF RETIRED NATUROPATHIC MEDICAL LICENSE.

Dr. Terlisner made a motion to rescind the approval of Cemet Lee's reinstatement of the retired naturopathic medical license. Seconded by Dr. Sadilek. Motion Carried 5 Ayes, 2 Absent.

	VOTE	SADILEK Chair	MARCHESE Vice Chair	TERLISNER Sec. /Tres.	ELDRIDGE	KALISH	BENNETT	TIBBITTS
Yes	5	x		x	x		x	x
No								
Abstain								
Absent	2		x			x		
Recused								

10. REVIEW, CONSIDERATION, AND POSSIBLE ACTION TO APPROVE CLEMENT LEE'S APPLICATION FOR REINSTATEMENT OF RETIRED NATUROPATHIC MEDICAL LICENSE WITH LIMITED SCOPE TO EXCLUDE ACUPUNCTURE.

Dr. Terlisner made a motion to approve Cemet Lee's application for reinstatement of retired naturopathic medical license with limited scope to exclude acupuncture. Seconded by Dr. Sadilek. Motion Carried 5 Ayes, 2 Absent.

	VOTE	SADILEK Chair	MARCHESE Vice Chair	TERLISNER Sec. /Tres.	ELDRIDGE	KALISH	BENNETT	TIBBITTS
Yes	5	x		x	x		x	x
No								
Abstain								

Absent	2		x			x		
Recused								

11. EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR REPORT

- A. Statute and Rules Review
 - B. Office Relocation, and Possible Consolidation
 - C. 24 Month Sunset Follow up Report
 - D. eLicensing Update
 - E. AZ CSPMP Audit
 - F. Dismissal of Cases by the Executive Director
 - G. Budget
 - H. Cases Under Investigation
 - I. Status of Board Ordered Consent Agreements
 - J. Current Licensee Numbers
- No Action Required

**12. CALL TO THE PUBLIC
NO REQUESTS**

13. ADJOURNMENT

**DR. SADILEK MADE A MOTION TO ADJOURN THE MEETING. SECONDED BY DR ELDRIDGE. MOTION CARRIED 5 AYES, 2 ABSENT.
THE MEETING ADJOURNED AT 2:52 PM**