



State Of Arizona
Naturopathic Physicians Medical Board
 “Protecting the Public’s Health”

1400 West Washington • Suite 230 • Phoenix, AZ 85007 • Telephone 602-542-8242 • FAX 602-542-3093
 Website www.aznd.gov
 TTY for Americans with Disability 800-367-8939 • Disability Voice Relay 800-842-4681

Douglas A. Ducey – Governor

Dr. Bruce Sadilek, ND – Chair • Dr. Marianne Marchese, ND – Vice Chair • Dr. Amy Terlisner, ND– Secretary / Treasurer,
 Dr. John Eldridge, NMD– Physician Member - Brad H. Logan - Public Member,
 Jamie N. Bennett - Public Member, Karen Tibbitts- Public Member

MINUTES

BOARD MEETING

Thursday, November 12, 2015 • 1:00 p.m. • Basement Conference Room B-1
1400 West Washington • Phoenix, AZ 85007

1. Call to Order by Presiding Officer

- A. Roll call of Board members and establishment of a quorum to conduct meeting.
 The meeting was called to order at 1:06 pm.

		SADILEK Chair	MARCHESE Vice Chair	TERLISNER Sec. /Tres.	ELDRIDGE	LOGAN	BENNETT	TIBBITTS
Present	5	x	x	x		x	x	
Absent	2				x			x

Ms. Tibbitts joined the meeting at 1:08pm.

- B. Acknowledgement of presence of Board staff and legal counsel.
 Present were: Ms. Elizabeth Campbell: Assistant Attorney General, Ms. Gail Anthony: Executive Director.

2. Civility Statement

In accordance with the Open Meeting Law, the Board has a civility policy that prohibits any type of disorderly conduct that disrupts the Board from carrying out its business. Those violating this policy will be asked to modify their behavior and act civilly. If the disorderly conduct continues, the person may be removed from the meeting room. (Adopted 11/8/2012)

3. Executive Director Report

- Status of Administrative Operation**
- Procedural Matters**
- Summary of Agency Reports**
- Budget**
- Current Licensee Numbers**
- Current Case Numbers**
- No Action Required.

4. Call to the Public

No public addressed the Board.

5. Discussion, Consideration, Possible Action by Board of Consent Agenda

(Any item under consent may be removed for independent discussion and action by a Board Member.)

- C. **Declaration of any Conflict of Interest on any Item on the Consent Agenda.**
- D. **Request for Removal of any Consent Agenda Item for independent discussion and possible action by the Board.**

None Requested.

- E. **Discussion, Consideration, Possible Action and by Board of Regular and Executive Session Minutes of September 10, 2015.**

Ms. Bennett made a motion to accept the minutes. Seconded by Dr. Marchese. Motion carried 6 Ayes, 1 Absent.

	VOTE	SADILEK Chair	MARCHESE Vice Chair	TERLISNER Sec. /Tres.	ELDRIDGE	LOGAN	BENNETT	TIBBITTS
Yes	6	x	x	x		x	x	x
No								
Abstain								
Absent	1				x			
Recused								

- F. **Discussion, Consideration, Possible Action by the Board of Medical License(s) / Examination Application.**

Anderson, Elizabeth(temporary license issued in accordance with A.R.S. 32- 1522.01)
 Bradford, Alan (temporary license issued in accordance with A.R.S. 32- 1522.01)
 Coffin, Connor
 Cooper, Jessica, (temporary license issued in accordance with A.R.S. 32- 1522.01)
 Falkner, Michaela ,(temporary license issued in accordance with A.R.S. 32- 1522.01)
 Gillman, Elizabeth temporary license issued in accordance with A.R.S. 32- 1522.01
 Hobi, Annette (temporary license issued in accordance with A.R.S. 32- 1522.01)
 Kasian, Stefan(temporary license issued in accordance with A.R.S. 32- 1522.01)
 Kilgore, Jennifer (temporary license issued in accordance with A.R.S. 32- 1522.01
 Mauss, Johanna (temporary license issued in accordance with A.R.S. 32- 1522.01)
 Maymon, Scott (temporary license issued in accordance with A.R.S. 32- 1522.01)
 Misir, Parabatie(temporary license issued in accordance with A.R.S. 32- 1522.01)
 Noronha, Bethania (temporary license issued in accordance with A.R.S. 32- 1522.01
 Osteroot, Cory (temporary license issued in accordance with A.R.S. 32- 1522.01
 Purvis, Kathryn,(temporary license issued in accordance with A.R.S. 32- 1522.01)
 Romero, Cynthia,(temporary license issued in accordance with A.R.S. 32- 1522.01)
 Rundle, Graciela (temporary license issued in accordance with A.R.S. 32- 1522.01)
 Simonson, Nina (temporary license issued in accordance with A.R.S. 32- 1522.01)
 Singler, Kirsten
 Slater, Darrienne (temporary license issued in accordance with A.R.S. 32- 1522.01)
 Stone, Sarah (temporary license issued in accordance with A.R.S. 32- 1522.01)
 Tade, Caroline (temporary license issued in accordance with A.R.S. 32- 1522.01)
 Wdowin, Heather, Reinstatement of Expired License, Current License in CA.
 (temporary license issued in accordance with A.R.S. 32- 1522.01)

- G. **Discussion, Consideration, Possible Action by the Board of Renewal of Medical License**

Abel, Larry
 Adair, Roger
 Albornoz-Sanchez, Leah

Atkins, Adriane
Bain, Jaclyn
Belt, Amber
Bird, Robb
Bishop, Kristen
Boor, Terry
Brooks, Barbara
Cerre, Eric
Chastant, Brandon
Christodoulakis, Theo
Collins, Kelly
Cook, Sarah Bedell
Crinnion, Walter
Cronin, Courtney
Darley, April
Darragh, Angela
de Graaff, Sonja
Dean, Jeffrey
Deville, Lauren
Dicampoli, Jesika
DiFilippo, Mary
Ellsworth, Robert
Fernandez, Lena Bojaj
Finker, Jillian
Fischer, Rainer
Freeze, Karen
Gianni, Judy
Girard, Christine
Gorman, Julie
Hooker, Laree
Jamison, Carol
Jarvis, Linda
Jeffers, Monica
Kasdorf, Cheryl
Keilty, Jeni
Khoshaba, linda
Kim, Cho Long
Kwan, Laurinda
Le Provost, Jean-Luc
Lee, Stephen
Maltais, Shannon
Martell, Laura
Mehrabani, Ardeschir
Messer, Stephen
Mitchell, Kenneth
Nafe, Babak
Novakova, Katerina
O'Brien, Kareen
Oskin, Jamie
Oxley, Barbara
Oxley, John
Peace, Timothy

Popiel, Brian
Porter, Jason
Rhodes, Rachel
Rice, Elizabeth
Rodriguez, Yolanda
Rogalla, Deborah
Sabatier, Steven
Schroer, Chad
Seubert, Mychael
Sickinger, Karleen
Snowden, Rebecca
Spira-O'Connor, Andrea
Stalker, MaryAnn
Stark, Stephanie
Steinborn, Shawn
Stevens, June
Stewart, Adrienne
Stills, Sharon
Stone, Carolyn
Stouk, Olya
Strong, Christine
Swan, Farra
Tecaya, Kam
Tehranian, Nivana
Turner, Leila
Uzick, Michael
Vaghela, Monica
Walker, Catherine
Walker, Samuel
Wazny, Philip
Weeshoff, Laura
Williamson, John
York, Shannon
Yosef, Isaac
Yurgel, Betty
Zupa, Victoria

H. **Discussion, Consideration, Possible Action by the Board of Application(s) for Certificate to Dispense (initial)**

Bradford, Alan
Crusey, Jessica
Falkner, Michaela
Gillman, Elizabeth
Hobi, Annette
Holloway, Ronelle
Livingood-Anderson, Elizabeth
Maymon, Scott
Meeds, Wilfre
Misir, Parabatie
Noronha, Bethania
Ostroot, Cory
Purvis, Kathryn

Romero, Cynthia
Simonson, Nina
Stone, Sarah
Tade, Caroline
Werling, Gina

I. **Discussion, Consideration, Possible Action by the Board of Application(s) for Renewal of Certificate to Dispense.**

Abbott, Crystal
Arneson, David
Botham, Jennifer
Brooks, Barbara (Reinstatement of Expired Certificate)
Cain, Briana
Ceballos-Logan, Gladys
Christodoulakis, Theo (Reinstatement of Expired Certificate)
Chungn, Ashley
Ezrre, Barbara
Greenfield, Jacqueline
Hazel, Sara (Reinstatement of Expired Certificate)
Hering, Lance
Hutyrova, Daniela
Jacques, F. Debbie
Mitchell, Tiffany
Muratore, Kathleen
Nichols, Douglas
Odgren-Cole, Jill
Ramsey, Theresa
Robinson, John
Rudderham, Mark
Tallman, David
Tondora, Christina
Willifahrt, Karen
Wojslaw, Heather

J. **Discussion, Consideration, Possible Action by the Board of Application(s) for Preceptorship Certificate.**

Bayrd, Shanna (Engage) - Initial
Blonda, Sabrina (Engage) - Initial
Kilgore, Jennifer (Conduct) - Initial
Morstein, Mona (Conduct)- Renewal
Phillips, Mark - (Engage) - Initial
Tasalloti, Yasaman - (Engage) - Initial
Werner, Stefanie - (Engage)- Initial

K. **Discussion, Consideration, Possible Action by the Board of Application(s) for Renewal of Certificate to Engage in a Clinical Training Program.**

Abed, Wafa
Afshar, Farzam
Arnold, Kenya
Bennett, Sarah
Bennett, Shannon
Douglas, Khadija

Franklin, Jameelah
 Garcia, Victoria
 Garza, Andrea
 Hogue, John
 Jatta, Ebrahim
 Lima, Paula
 Martin, Raquel
 McCaw, Leanne
 Mitchell, Sasha
 Pannu, Neelamjeet
 Powell, Arthur
 Riaz, Samar
 Sayadian, Serop
 Singh, Sahib
 Tenney, Michelle
 Touw, Henderson
 Wallace, Kristine
 White, Iasha
 Whitten, Aaron

CONSENT AGENDA VOTE

Dr. Marchese made a motion to approve items 5 F - K. Seconded by Ms. Bennett. Motion carried, 6 Ayes, 1 Absent.

	VOTE	SADILEK Chair	MARCHESE Vice Chair	TERLISNER Sec. /Tres.	ELDRIDGE	LOGAN	BENNETT	TIBBITTS
Yes	6	x	x	x		x	x	x
No								
Abstain								
Absent	1				x			
Recused								

6. Regulatory Matters

- L. **Discussion, Consideration, Possible Action by the Board of Investigations and Complaints.**
 (The Board may go into executive session on any of the following items under A.R.S. §38-431.03(A)(2) for discussion of any information made confidential by law.)

- (1) **Dr. Daren Hazen, Case No. 15-022 - Investigative Interview.**

Dr. Hazen was not present. Dr. Marchese requested information regarding the Testosterone prescriptions written by Dr. Hazen for a family member. Dr. Terlisner made a motion to move the matter to Formal Interview and gather further information regarding the origination of the prescriptions. Seconded by Dr. Marchese. Motion carried, 6 Ayes, 1 Absent.

	VOTE	SADILEK Chair	MARCHESE Vice Chair	TERLISNER Sec. /Tres.	ELDRIDGE	LOGAN	BENNETT	TIBBITTS
Yes	6	x	x	x		x	x	x
No								
Abstain								
Absent	1				x			
Recused								

(2) Michael Allen, Board Review of Attorney Proposal Regarding Resolution of Licensure Denial.

Mr. Allen was not present. Attorney Kim Kent was present representing Mr. Allen.

Ms. Kent presented a request to the Board to issue Mr. Allen an "inactive" licensure status. It was pointed out by Dr. Marchese, Dr. Sadilek, and again during Ms. Campbell's summary, that pursuant to statute, the Board does not have the authority to issue such a status. Further it was noted by Ms. Campbell, Mr. Allen is a licensed Chiropractor in the State of California. Although California does license naturopathic physicians, he does not hold a naturopathic medical license in that state. And by his own admission, he has not practiced naturopathic medicine in 30 years. Ms. Kent requested Board permission for Mr. Allen to withdraw his application for license reinstatement, in order to avoid the negative credentialing regarding the Board's denial.

Dr. Sadilek made a motion to grant permission for Mr. Allen to withdraw his application for reinstatement of his State of Arizona Naturopathic Medical license. Seconded by Mr. Logan. Motion carried, 6 Ayes, 1 Absent.

	VOTE	SADILEK Chair	MARCHESE Vice Chair	TERLISNER Sec. /Tres.	ELDRIDGE	LOGAN	BENNETT	TIBBITTS
Yes	6	x	x	x		x	x	x
No								
Abstain								
Absent	1				x			
Recused								

(3) Dr. Daniel Larke, Case No. 15-017 - Investigative Interview.

Dr. Larke was present along with Counsel; Ms. Adams. The Complainant was not present. Dr.

Sadilek stated after review of the records, it appears Dr. Larke does provide emergency phone numbers and that the procedure was demonstrated to the patient. Dr. Marchese asked if the patient was seen in the office after the alleged incident. Dr. Larke replied that he spoke to the patient on the phone and urged him to return to the office for an examination, but that the patient refused to be seen and stated he wanted his money back. Dr. Terlisner stated she found Dr. Larke's forms and records to be very nicely done and made a motion to dismiss. Seconded by Dr.

Sadilek. Motion carried, 6 Ayes, 1 Absent.

	VOTE	SADILEK Chair	MARCHESE Vice Chair	TERLISNER Sec. /Tres.	ELDRIDGE	LOGAN	BENNETT	TIBBITTS
Yes	6	x	x	x		x	x	x
No								
Abstain								
Absent	1				x			
Recused								

(4) Alex F. Nunez, Case No. 15-013 - (Unregulated).

Board members expressed their concern regarding the recent activity of this individual. The Executive Director was directed to place a cautionary statement on the Board's website regarding the importance of checking credentials, and further directed to meet with the Attorney General's office, the County Attorney's office, and refer the matter to the State of Arizona Nursing Board.

(5) Jennifer Brooks / Tyteeka Reye - Case No. 15-015 - (Unregulated).

Ms. Tibbitts recused herself. Ms. Brooks and Ms. Reye were present. Both individuals had been found to be using the protected title language in websites and advertising, and were sent cease and desists letters by the Board. Ms. Brooks and Ms. Reyes told the Board they had made changes to their websites in order to become compliant. Dr. Marchese pointed out evidence supplied to the Board by the investigator, that the website; www.equinese.com had not been changed, and still used the protected title of Naturopathic Doctor. Dr. Sadilek informed both Ms. Brooks and Ms. Reye that they must comply completely with the cease and desist order. Board staff advised periodic checks for compliance will be done.

(6) Dr. Julie George, Case No. 15-023 - Investigative Interview.

Dr. George was present along with Counsel; Ms. Neal. The Complainant and her husband were present. There was no evidence found to substantiate the complainant's allegation of reckless prescribing of glutathione by Dr. George, or that the glutathione caused any type of neurological damage to the patient. Dr. Terlisner encouraged Dr. George to take steps to increase her availability to patients in order to immediately address any type of toxic reaction, if she continues to practice environmental medicine. Dr. Marchese agreed with Dr. Terlisner and cautioned Dr. George to be aware that anyone can have a reaction to anything. Dr. Sadilek made a motion to dismiss. Seconded by Dr. Marchese Motion carried, 5 Ayes, 1 Nay, 1 Absent.

	VOTE	SADILEK Chair	MARCHESE Vice Chair	TERLISNER Sec. /Tres.	ELDRIDGE	LOGAN	BENNETT	TIBBITTS
Yes	5	x	x			x	x	x
No	1			x				
Abstain								
Absent	1				x			
Recused								

(7) Dr. Cheryl Kubacz, Case No. 15-012 - Investigative Interview.

Dr. Kubacz was not present. Dr. Marchese stated she looked at the noted laser setting in the records, but that she does not practice esthetic medicine, and does not know if these types of settings are too high or are appropriate. Dr. Sadilek suggested getting a secondary consult on the case from someone who practices this type of medicine. Dr. Terlisner made a motion to get a consultation on the case from an expert in the field, as well as moving the case forward to Formal Interview. Seconded by Dr. Marchese. Motion carried, 6 Ayes, 1 Absent.

	VOTE	SADILEK Chair	MARCHESE Vice Chair	TERLISNER Sec. /Tres.	ELDRIDGE	LOGAN	BENNETT	TIBBITTS
Yes	6	x	x	x		x	x	x
No								
Abstain								
Absent	1				x			
Recused								

(8) Dr. Laurie Moody, Case No. 14-015- Update

Ms. Campbell gave a brief update on the status of the case.

No action required by the Board.

(9) Dr. Kathleen Muratore, Request for Probation Termination.

Dr. Marchese made a motion to approve the request for probation termination. Seconded by Dr. Terlisner. Motion carried, 6 Ayes, 1 Absent.

	VOTE	SADILEK Chair	MARCHESE Vice Chair	TERLISNER Sec. /Tres.	ELDRIDGE	LOGAN	BENNETT	TIBBITTS
Yes	6	x	x	x		x	x	x
No								
Abstain								
Absent	1				x			
Recused								

M. Discussion, Consideration, Possible Action on Applications.

(1) Caren Kunda, Application for Medical Assistant. - Applicant withdrew.

No action by the Board

(2) Vanessa Ferreira, Application for Medical License.

Ms. Ferreira was present. During the application review a 2012 arrest for DUI was indicated on source documents. Dr. Sadilek asked Ms. Ferreira if she had an issue with alcohol, she stated she did not. Dr Terlisner made a motion to approve the application for medical license. Seconded by Dr. Sadilek. Motion carried, 6 Ayes, 1 Absent.

	VOTE	SADILEK Chair	MARCHESE Vice Chair	TERLISNER Sec. /Tres.	ELDRIDGE	LOGAN	BENNETT	TIBBITTS
Yes	6	x	x	x		x	x	x
No								
Abstain								
Absent	1				x			
Recused								

(3) Dr. Amy Terlisner, Application for Renewal of Medical License.

Dr. Terlisner recused herself. Dr. Sadilek made a motion to approve the application for licensure reinstatement. Seconded by Dr. Marchese. Motion carried, 5 Ayes, 1 Recused, 1 Absent.

	VOTE	SADILEK Chair	MARCHESE Vice Chair	TERLISNER Sec. /Tres.	ELDRIDGE	LOGAN	BENNETT	TIBBITTS
Yes	5	x	x			x	x	x
No								
Abstain								
Absent	1				x			
Recused	1			x				

(4) Dr. Marianne Marchese, Application for Renewal of Medical License.

Dr. Marchese recused herself. Dr. Sadilek made a motion to approve the application for licensure reinstatement. Seconded by Ms. Tibbitts. Motion carried, 5 Ayes, 1 Recused, 1 Absent.

	VOTE	SADILEK Chair	MARCHESE Vice Chair	TERLISNER Sec. /Tres.	ELDRIDGE	LOGAN	BENNETT	TIBBITTS
Yes	5	x		x		x	x	x
No								
Abstain								
Absent	1				x			
Recused	1		x					

(5) Jelina Ip, Application for Medical License by Endorsement.

Dr. Sadilek stated that by law, Ms. Ip meets the requirements for application by endorsement and made a motion to accept the application for licensure, and noted the license will be issued with a limited scope which does not include the ability to practice acupuncture. Seconded by Dr. Marchese. Motion carried, 6 Ayes, 1 Absent.

	VOTE	SADILEK Chair	MARCHESE Vice Chair	TERLISNER Sec. /Tres.	ELDRIDGE	LOGAN	BENNETT	TIBBITTS
Yes	6	x	x	x		x	x	x
No								
Abstain								
Absent	1				x			
Recused								

7. Discussion, Consideration and Possible Action by the Board Regarding S.W. College of Naturopathic Medicine's Proposed Change to Board Rules, Regarding Continuing Medical Education Approval.

Mr. Greg Harris was present representing Southwest College of Naturopathic Medicine, and requested the Board to approve a docket opening regarding a proposed rule change. Mr. Harris discussed the proposed change; which would expand the rule to allow accredited naturopathic colleges to approve CME. Dr. Marchese and Dr. Terlisner asked Mr. Harris why the College wants the ability to approve their own CME and not just continue getting approval through the AzNMA? Mr. Harris stated they sought to streamline the process. Dr. Terlisner raised the question of how it would streamline to process. Mr. Harris was not able to answer the question. Ms. Cathy Stuart; the Executive Director of the AzNMA and Dr. Lee; representing the AzNMA, were available to answer Board questions. Ms. Stuart pointed out that the College had only recently come to them for CME approval, and had not requested approval prior to that. Dr. Marchese pointed out the rules process is costly and time consuming and that there may not be a compelling reason to do so in this case. Dr. Sadilek made a motion to table the matter until January, giving the College the ability to prepare additional information regarding the request. Seconded by Dr. Terlisner. Roll Call Vote: Ms. Bennett; Aye, Ms. Tibbitts; Aye, Dr. Terlisner; Aye, Dr. Marchese; Aye, Dr. Sadilek; Aye. Motion carried, 6 Ayes, 1 Absent.

	VOTE	SADILEK Chair	MARCHESE Vice Chair	TERLISNER Sec. /Tres.	ELDRIDGE	LOGAN	BENNETT	TIBBITTS
Yes	6	x	x	x		x	x	x
No								
Abstain								
Absent	1				x			
Recused								

8. Board Member Training

Ms. Campbell presented a short training session.

9. Discussion, Consideration, Possible Action by the Board of Complaint Prioritizing, Category and Sanction Range Document. -

Tabled

ADJOURNMENT

The meeting was adjourned at 4:25 pm.