



State of Arizona Naturopathic Physicians Medical Board

“Protecting the Public’s Health”

1740 W. Adams, Ste. 3002 • Phoenix, AZ 85007 • Telephone 602-542-8242

Website <https://nd.az.gov>

TTY for Americans with Disability 800-367-8939 • Disability Voice Relay 800-842-4681

Douglas A. Ducey – Governor

Dr. Bruce Sadilek, ND – Chair, Dr. Brian J. Popiel, ND – Vice Chair, Karen Tibbitts – Secretary/Treasurer

Diva Galan – Public Member, Dr. Clinton C. Campbell, Ph.D – Public Member

Dr. Tam Spat, ND – Physician Member, Dr. Daniel Rubin, ND– Physician Member

BOARD MEETING MINUTES

Thursday, May 14, 2020 • 12:30 p.m. • Board Room B

1740 W. Adams Phoenix, AZ 85007

1. CALL TO ORDER BY PRESIDING OFFICER

The meeting was called to order at 12:32 by Dr. Bruce Sadilek, Chair.

- A. Roll call of Board members and establishment of a quorum to conduct meetings.
Ms. Anthony called roll.

	VOTE	SADILEK Chair	POPIEL Vice Chair	TIBBITTS Sec. / Tres.	GALAN	CAMPBELL	RUBIN	SPAT
All Present Via Phone	6	x	x	x	x		x	x
Absent	1					x		
Vacant	0							

- B. Acknowledgement of presence of Board staff and legal counsel.
Mr. Marc Harris, A.A.G. Present Via Phone
Ms. Gail Anthony, Executive Director

2. DECLARATIONS OF CONFLICTS OF INTEREST

None Declared

3. CIVILITY STATEMENT

Dr. Sadilek read the statement into the record.

4. CONSENT AGENDA – REVIEW, CONSIDERATION, AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING APPROVAL OF THE FOLLOWING APPLICATIONS.

A. Naturopathic Medical License by Examination

Afshar, Farzam (temporary license issued in accordance with A.R.S. § 32-1522.01)

Friedland, Tarah (temporary license issued in accordance with A.R.S. § 32-1522.01)

Martin, Raquel (temporary license issued in accordance with A.R.S. § 32-1522.01)

B. Naturopathic Medical License by Endorsement

Alexe, Luminita (temporary license issued in accordance with A.R.S. § 32-1522.01)

C. Renewal Medical License

D. Retire Medical License

E. Initial Certificate to Dispense

Aubrecht, Serina

Coultas, Sarah

Darby, Susan

Duong, Emmeline

Friedland, Tarah

Irwin, Rebecca

Jamshidi, Michael

Johnston, Shantele

Martin, Raquel

Melikyan, Vahe

Orme, Michelle

Ramanan, Karthik

Savage, Nicholas

Shaheen, Emmalee

Shashtri, Nisharg

Taylor, Sasha

Tschudy, Nathaniel

Villa, Laura

Zuniga, Samuel

F. Reinstatement Certificate to Dispense

Shenkman, Brett

G. Renewal Certificate to Dispense

Abbott, Crystal

Alejandro, Angelina

Alexandria, Karsten

Allshouse, Andrew

Alvarez, Wilbert-John

Anderson, Erin

Arnold, Kenya

Attah Prince, Ubong

Audette, Kathleen

Aussems, Christopher
Austin, Kristin
Axelrod, Leslie
Bachelier, Aimee
Badalamenti, Laura
Bahnam, Kira
Bakty-Johnson, Esti
Banaian, Azam
Banker, Rosanna
Barraza, Michelle
Barreda, Nicole
Beck, Forrest
Berkner, Kristin
Bilyeu, Angela
Birdsall, Timothy
Blasi, Jennifer
Bliniecki, Michele
Boarakowski, Natalya
Borchert, Katie
Borsa, Robin
Boyer, Veronica
Brandeis, Damien
Britz, Julia
Brooks, Barbara
Bryant, Roselynde
Burke, Tara
Buxbaum, Dane
Calimeri, Susan
Carrell, Carol
Castle, Holly
Chastant, Brandon
Chinoy, Riyana
Christian, Shonna
Christianson, Alan
Chung, Ashley
Cline, Christine
Clough, Kelly
Coats, Faith
Compton, Christina
Contreras-Lopez, Andrea
Craig, David
Cramer, David
Crocker, Ephraim
Cronin, Kyle
Cronin, Michael
Crowley, Rachel
Culver, Alyssa

Cummins, Emy
D'Aprile, Delores
Davis, Heather
De Escobar, Marcos Decio
De Graaff, Sonja
De La Torre Hogan, Elizabeth
Dean, Bridget
Dickens, Andrew
Dickerson, Wendy
DiFillippo, Mary
Dooley, Melonni
Drobot, Jeffrey
Dunbar, S. Ross
Dye, Jennifer
Dye, John
Eastman, Carole
Eaton, Lois
Edwards, Kevin
Eggerling, Chrystie
Eischens, Shawna
Ellis, Erin
Ellsworth, Robert
Engard, Kimberly
Felton, Lynnea
Ferchoff, Ryan
Fischer, Rainer
Flagler, Lila
Flagler, Samuel
Folz, Jessica
Fontaine, De Andrea
Franco, Gioacchino
Frank, Thomas
Frederick, David
Fujii, Kristen
Fuller, Carolyn
Galaburri, Mario
Gariboldi, Matthew
Garvin, Maggie
Gason, Clark
Gear, Robert
Gentry, Jennifer
Gianni, Judy
Goetz, Chad
Gold, Amy
Gomendi, Sara
Gonzales, Mike
Grady, Elizabeth

DRAFT

Green Lustig, Kimberly
Greengard, Kristina
Grimes Saber, DeeAnn
Grund, Andrea
Gutowski, Louise
Habashy, Jennifer
Harris, Breckin
Harris, Kimberly
Hayes, Cynthia
Heffner, Karlee
Helioti, Maria
Helms, Laurent Stephun
Hernandez, Matthew
Hinjosa, Cynthia
Holloway, Ronelle
Houtan, Houtaneh
Hull, Ginger
Husami, Margaret
Huston Myles, Stephanie
Hyun, Yu-Ree
Ibarra, Nallely
Inouye, Vance
Iverson, Carol
James, Charmainge
Janjua, Kiran
January, Chelsea
Jashidi, Michael
Jeffers, Monica
Jensen, Jason
Johnson, Eric
Johnson, Nick
Johnson, Sonya
Johnston, Shantele
Just, Scott
Karbon, Chelsea
Kasdorf, Cheryl
Katz, Steven
Keiffer, Julie
Kennedy, Laura
Kerievsky, Adam
Kerievsky, Ross H.
Kim, Cho Long
King, Denette
Knapp, Michael
Kopcio, Jordan
Koudelka, Barbara
Kovalik, Christina

Krukowski, Jody
Lambert Rampe, Laura
Lambert, Linda
Landino, Kimberly
Larke, Daniel
Lashutka, Kenneth
Lee, Stephen
Lehto, Trisha
Leskie, Robert
Lewis, Danielle
Lim, Hillary
Lioce, Lucia
Lopez, Eric Edward
Lovick, Ann
Luevano, Libia
Lupo, Kelly
Madsen, Christine
Magerus, Tracy
Major, Michael
Malina, Gabriela
Manrique, Javier
Markham, Jennifer
Martin, Lindsay
Matijevic, Dejan
Maturo, Lisa
May, Jasmine
McDaniel, Allison
Meeds, Wilfred
Mehrabani, Ardeschir
Meraz Ramanan, Samantha
Messer, Stephen
Miller-Sickels, Laura
Milligan, Christopher
Misir, Parabatie
Mittman, Arie
Mittman, Laura
Mizera-Lieske, Kimberlyn
Mkrtchyan, Anna
Molina, Jose
Moreno, Celaine
Morris, Lance
Morris, Neil
Muhammad, Hanifah
Muro, Eugene
Murray, M. Ann
Nafe, Babak
Nagallo, Krisel

DRAFT

Neeley, Kyle
Nelson, Erik
Nelson, William
Nguyen, Krystine
Nikolic, Elizabeth
Nordin, Anna
Nowak-Stears, Julie
Nuckolls, Katheryn
O'Hara, Amy
Oertle, John
Orlowski, Andria
Orlowski, Jennifer
Oskin, Jamie
Papadeas, Nathan
Parent, Daina
Patterson, Chad
Peruch, Tracy
Peyman, Tara
Placella, Naomi
Poulin, Corrine
Predmore, Leslie
Price, Tess
Proefrock, Kenneth
Qamar-Busler, Leticia
Rabizadeh, Homan
Raisanen, Pater
Rames, Oceana
Redwine, Alison
Reker, Mary
Reveron, Jorge
Rice, Elizabeth
Rich, Gregory
Richardson, Dorian
Rittling, Carrie
Robinson, John
Rodriguez, Yolanda
Rogalla, Deborah
Roodvoets, Chelsea
Rosario Beitel, Sue
Royer, Lacey
Ruinard, Leytocha
Ruiz, Guillermo
Sabeti, Arash
Sage, Kathryn
Salzwedel, Kristen
Santo, Carlos
Sayadian, Serop

DRAFT

Saydman, Michele
Schneller, Katharine
Selvey, Don
Sexton, Trevor
Shaw, Anne
Shiffler, Nichole
Sickinger, Karleen
Skelton, Janice
Slater, Cara
Smith, Bradley
Smith, Todd
Sorr, Steven
Spector Deneen, Shana
Spira-O'Connor, Andrea
St. Clair, Julia
St. Rose, II, John
Stark, Stephanie
Stefanski, Jessica
Steinberger, Katrina
Steinborn, Shawn
Stewart, Elaine
Stone, Carolyn
Stratton, Susan
Strong, Christine
Suhaila, Lena
Sundene, Nicole
Swan, Farra
Swanick, Summer
Szeto, Katherine
Tabares, Amber
Taddiken, Elizabeth
Tade, Caroline
Tallman, David
Tallman, Ty
Tapia, Paola
Tayler, Tevna
Taylor, Jennifer
Tecaya, Kam
Tehranian, Nirvana
Tellier, Krystal
Tenney, Michelle
Terranella, Robin
Thatcher, Michelle
Thom, Dickson
Thomas, Suzanne
Trahan, Sarah
Troutt, William

DRAFT

Turner, Jessica
Turner, Leila
Turner, Mary Jo
Turner, Tiffany
Tveit-Pettersen, Sonja
Van Driel, Evan
Ventura, Jose
Volk, Kimberly
Vose, Erik
Waldman, Renee
Wallace, Kristine
Warren, Brittany
Warren, Daniel
Watkins, Olivia
Wayne, Emilee
Wazny, Phillip
Weiner, Andrea
Weirick, Susan
Wells, Wendy
Werner, Stafanie
Weyrich, Orville
Whelchel, Rebecca
White, Lasha
Whitley, Marine
Whitney, Travis
Whittington, Amy
Willfahrt, Karen
Willhauck, Mihrage
Williams, Crystal
Williamson, Phillip
Winnett, Kelly
Wirth, Alexxa
Witman, James
Woeller, DeAnna
Wojciak, Bret
Wojslaw, Heather
Wooten, Tracy
Worden, Donese
Wright, Ellie
Wright, Kimberly
Wright, Shenice
Xan Simonson, Nina
Young, Aria
Zamora, Jamie
Zdan, Jill
Zeller, Barrie
Zoil, Judith

DRAFT

Zuniga, Samuel
 Zupa, Victoria

H. Initial Certificate to Engage in a Clinical Training Program

Dutto, Alessandra
 Ramirez, Jillian (reapply due to leave of absence)
 Santiago, Ruth (reapply due to leave of absence)

I. Renewal Certificate to Engage in a Clinical Training Program
 Price, Traci

J. Initial Certificate to Engage in a Preceptorship Training Program

K. Initial Certificate to Conduct a Preceptorship Training Program

Consent Agenda Vote: Dr. Sadilek made a motion to approve consent agenda items 4 A – K. Seconded by Dr. Popiel. Roll Call: Motion Carried 6 Ayes, 1 Absent.

	VOTE	SADILEK Chair	POPIEL Vice Chair	TIBBITTS Sec. / Tres.	GALAN	CAMPBELL	RUBIN	SPAT
Yes	6	x	x	x	x		x	x
No	0							
Abstain	0							
Absent	1					x		
Recused	0							
Vacant	0							

5. REVIEW, CONSIDERATION, AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING THE FOLLOWING BOARD CASES.

A. Dr. Jeoff Drobot, Case No.20-141, Initial Review
 Respondent appeared via telephone.

Ms. Anthony summarized the Board received a complaint from Dr. Hendrieka Fitzpatrick, M.D. alleging Respondent’s failure to keep adequate medical records. Dr. Fitzpatrick is employed by a clinic in Rhode Island in which Respondent is partial owner, however his primary practice location is located in Arizona.

Respondent stated he has a license in Rhode Island, and had gone to the clinic several times to help out. He stated that the clinic has several different charting software programs in place, including paper charting. The paper charts were not scanned properly, and the paper charts were shredded.

Respondent stated that the 2 year old patient named in the complaint did not have an issue with his care as the complainant alleged.

Dr. Sadilek asked Respondent to walk through his new patient process.

Respondent discussed the process. He explained the patients are not there because they need primary care, or for acute care.

Dr. Sadilek asked about patient 3 in the board case.

Respondent explained he was a long time patient, Dr. Fitzpatrick requested the chart notes and but didn't look at but a few pages.

Dr. Sadilek noted Respondent took part of Dr. Cronin's charting CME, and asked if it was taken after he got the Board complaint.

Respondent stated it was before, and had asked her to come out to the clinic and review.

Dr. Rubin commented how important charting is, and after review of Respondent's chart notes find them hard to follow to the point where he cannot even tell where intake is. Respondent stated most of the patient records reviewed were done in Rhode Island. Dr. Rubin stated he was going back to look at patient three which originated in Arizona.

Dr. Popiel stated he agrees with Dr. Rubin, that the notes are hard to follow, and asked Respondent how he does follow up, particularly with the patients on testosterone, what are the follow up requirements, does he require follow up labs. And he can't tell what direction he is taking the patient in.

Dr. Rubin brought several pages to the Board's attention, one page had one line as in the charting section, and another note pointing out that there is no way to know from the chart what the dosage of the medication listed is.

Dr. Rubin pointed out a chart note which appears to be an appropriate full page of information. Respondent stated that was after the charting course.

Dr. Spat stated his feelings are the same as Dr. Rubin's and agrees with the observation of lack of chat notes.

Ms. Tibbitts and Ms. Galan had no questions for Respondent.

Dr. Sadilek stated he agrees with Dr. Popiel and Dr. Rubin, that based on those initial notes there would be no way to tell what he was doing, what the clinical assessment was, and it appears he didn't even do a blood pressure or pulse.

Dr. Rubin stated he only sees one instance of improved charting, the March 5th note, and is of the opinion that it would be appropriate to see additional charting from the Arizona patients over the course of the next few months to see if there is actual improvement.

Dr. Popiel agreed and would like to see additional chart notes as well in order to have confidence that they are improving, and wondered if they wanted to offer a consent agreement.

Mr. Harris pointed out that another option was to continue the matter for further investigation in order to obtain additional charts for review.

Dr. Rubin and Dr. Popiel agreed that an additional 4 chart notes would be appropriate for review.

Dr. Sadilek made a motion to continue the case for 90 day for further investigation, and during that time have staff obtain 4 additional Arizona charts for Board review to ensure appropriate charting has continued. Dr. Rubin seconded the motion.

Roll Call: Motion Carried 6 Ayes, 1 Absent.

	VOTE	SADILEK Chair	POPIEL Vice Chair	TIBBITTS Sec. / Tres.	GALAN	CAMPBELL	RUBIN	SPAT
Yes	6	x	x	x	x		x	x
No	0							
Abstain	0							
Absent	1					x		
Recused	0							
Vacant	0							

6. REVIEW, CONSIDERATION AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING APPLICATION FOR NATUROPATHIC MEDICAL LICENSE, TERI BAGNASCO.

Applicant appeared via telephone.

Ms. Anthony summarized the application for medical license by examination reviewing Applicant holds an M.D. license in the State of Arizona. Applicant had disclosed 2 previous malpractice settlement, no actions were taken by the medical board regarding these settlements.

Dr. Sadilek asked Applicant if she is still practicing emergency medicine. She respondent she was and was not sure how much she will be practicing naturopathic medicine.

No other board members had questions.

Dr. Popiel made a motion to approve the application. Seconded by Dr. Rubin.

Roll Call: Motion Carried 6 Ayes, 1 Absent.

	VOTE	SADILEK Chair	POPIEL Vice Chair	TIBBITTS Sec. / Tres.	GALAN	CAMPBELL	RUBIN	SPAT
Yes	6	x	x	x	x		x	x
No	0							
Abstain	0							
Absent	1					x		
Recused	0							
Vacant	0							

7. REVIEW, CONSIDERATION AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING APPLICATION FOR RENEWAL OF CERTIFICATE TO DISPENSE.

A. Dr. Melissa Coats

Dr. Rubin recused himself. Dr. Sadilek made a motion to approve the application for Certificate renewal. Seconded by Ms. Tibbitts. Roll Call: Motion Carried 5 Ayes, 1 Recused, 1 Absent.

	VOTE	SADILEK Chair	POPIEL Vice Chair	TIBBITTS Sec. / Tres.	GALAN	CAMPBELL	RUBIN	SPAT
Yes	5	x	x	x	x			x
No	0							
Abstain	0							
Absent	1					x		
Recused	1						x	
Vacant	0							

B. Dr. Brian Popiel

Dr. Popiel recused himself. Dr. Sadilek made a motion to approve the application for Certificate renewal. Seconded by Ms. Galan. Roll Call: Motion Carried 5 Ayes, 1 Recused, 1 Absent.

	VOTE	SADILEK Chair	POPIEL Vice Chair	TIBBITTS Sec. / Tres.	GALAN	CAMPBELL	RUBIN	SPAT
Yes	5	x		x	x		x	x
No	0							
Abstain	0							
Absent	1					x		
Recused	1		x					
Vacant	0							

C. Dr. Bruce Sadilek

Dr. Sadilek recused himself. Dr. Popiel made a motion to approve the application for Certificate renewal. Seconded by Dr. Rubin. Roll Call: Motion Carried 5 Ayes, 1 Recused, 1 Absent.

	VOTE	SADILEK Chair	POPIEL Vice Chair	TIBBITTS Sec. / Tres.	GALAN	CAMPBELL	RUBIN	SPAT
Yes	5	x		x	x		x	x
No	0							
Abstain	0							

Absent	1					x		
Recused	1		x					
Vacant	0							

D. Dr. Tam Spat

Dr. Spat recused himself. Dr. Sadilek made a motion to approve the application for Certificate renewal. Seconded by Dr. Popiel. Roll Call: Motion Carried 5 Ayes, 1 Recused, 1 Absent.

	VOTE	SADILEK Chair	POPIEL Vice Chair	TIBBITTS Sec. / Tres.	GALAN	CAMPBELL	RUBIN	SPAT
Yes	5	x		x	x		x	x
No	0							
Abstain	0							
Absent	1					x		
Recused	1		x					
Vacant	0							

8. CONSENT AGENDA VOTE. REVIEW, CONSIDERATION, AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING DRAFT MINUTES.

- A. Draft Minutes of April 9, 2020 Meeting.
- B. Draft Executive Session Minutes of April 9, 2020.

Dr. Sadilek made a motion to approve items 8 A-B. Seconded by Dr. Popiel. Roll Call: Motion Carried 6 Ayes, 1 Absent.

	VOTE	SADILEK Chair	POPIEL Vice Chair	TIBBITTS Sec. / Tres.	GALAN	CAMPBELL	RUBIN	SPAT
Yes	6	x	x	x	x		x	x
No	0							
Abstain	0							
Absent	1					x		
Recused	0							
Vacant	0							

9. EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPORT

The Board may vote to go into Executive Session pursuant to A.R.S. § 32- 431.03(A)(2)(to discuss confidential information) or A.R.S. § 38-431.03(A)(3)(to receive legal advice).

- A. Budget
- B. Current Licensee and Certificate Holder Numbers
- C Current Number of Board Cases Under Investigation, Pending Before OAH, or On Hold Pending Outcome of Criminal Case.

No questions from the Board. No action required.

10. FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS

None requested

11. CALL TO THE PUBLIC

No Requests Received

12. ADJOURNMENT

The Chair adjourned the meeting at 1: 48 p.m.

DRAFT