



State of Arizona Naturopathic Physicians Medical Board

“Protecting the Public’s Health”

1740 W. Adams, Ste. 3002 • Phoenix, AZ 85007 • Telephone 602-542-8242

Website <https://nd.az.gov>

TTY for Americans with Disability 800-367-8939 • Disability Voice Relay 800-842-4681

Douglas A. Ducey – Governor

Dr. Bruce Sadilek, ND – Chair, Dr. Brian J. Popiel, ND – Vice Chair, Karen Tibbitts – Secretary/Treasurer

Diva Galan – Public Member, Dr. Clinton C. Campbell, Ph.D. – Public Member

Dr. Tam Spat – Physician Member, Dr. Daniel Rubin – Physician Member

MINUTES

**Thursday, March 12, 2020 • 12:30 p.m. • Board Room C, First Floor
1740 W. Adams Phoenix, AZ 85007**

1. CALL TO ORDER BY PRESIDING OFFICER

A. Roll call of Board members and establishment of a quorum to conduct meetings.

Dr. Sadilek called the meeting to order at 12:49 p.m.

| | VOTE | SADILEK Chair | POPIEL Vice Chair | TIBBITTS Sec. / Tres. | GALAN | CAMPBELL | RUBIN | SPAT |
|----------------------|------|------------------|-------------------------|-----------------------------|-------|----------|-------|------|
| Present Via Phone | 7 | x | x | x | x | x | x | x |
| Absent | 0 | | | | | | | |
| Vacant | 0 | | | | | | | |

B. Acknowledgement of presence of Board staff and legal counsel.

Ms. Sarah Asta, Assistant Attorney General

Ms. Jeanne Galvin, Assistant Attorney General

Ms. Gail Anthony, Executive Director

2. DECLARATIONS OF CONFLICTS OF INTEREST

None

3. CIVILITY STATEMENT

Dr. Sadilek read the statement into the record.

4. CONSENT AGENDA – REVIEW, CONSIDERATION, AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING APPROVAL OF THE FOLLOWING APPLICATIONS.

A. Naturopathic Medical License by Examination

B. Naturopathic Medical License by Endorsement

Bala, Sarumathy, (reduced scope, no acupuncture, temporary license issued in accordance

with A.R.S. § 32-1522.01)
Duong, Emmeline (reduced scope, no acupuncture, temporary license issued in accordance with A.R.S. § 32-1522.01)
Koorjee, Sara (temporary license issued in accordance with A.R.S. § 32-1522.01)
Potts, Aaron (reduced scope, no acupuncture, temporary license issued in accordance with A.R.S. § 32-1522.01)
Seddig, Elspeth (reduced scope, no acupuncture, temporary license issued in accordance with A.R.S. § 32-1522.01)

C. Renewal Medical License

Abel, Larry
Alibrio, Alice
Allen, Michael
Amerine, Lisa
Anderson, Allen
Balduzzi, Anthony
Balentine, Lynnette
Bilyeu, Angela
Binder, Tiffany
Blasi, Jennifer
Blasi, Jennifer
Bojaj Fernandez, Lena
Boor, Terry
Bramstedt, Jessica
Brown, Aiyana
Burns, Elaine
Burton-Teed, Blythe
Butner, Lana
Buxbaum, Dane
Cain, Briana
Cameron, Kathryn
Campbell, Erica
Caravone, Kimberly
Carpenter, Rebecca
Ceballos-Logan, Gladys
Cervigni, Maria
Cervigni, Maria
Chilcoat, Aisha
Cisar, Leslie
Coker, Helena
Coker, Helena
Compton, Christina
Cummins, Emy
Davenport, Emily
Davis, Teri
De Soler, Alexander
Dean, Vanessa
Dehnicke, Danette

Despotides, Bianca
Dietzgen, Mark
DiPalma, Michael
Doak, E. Frederike
Eggerling, Chrystie
Elton, Jennifer
Elton, Jennifer
Esquerdo, Ramon
Ford, Rebecca
Frank, Thomas
Frank, Thomas
Frank, Thomas
Gerard, Nicole
Gerstel, Johanne
Gibbons, Melissa
Glenn, Laura
Graham, Stephanie
Green, Wendy
Gustavson, Rebecca
Hawes, Courtney
Hawk, Diane
Hawk, Diane
Hawkins, Susan
Helms, Laurent Stephun
Highfield, Janice
Hill, Taylor
Hilli, Lisa
Holiday, Luke
Holloway, Ronelle
Hutyrova, Daniela
Ipson, Jarom
Jackson, Janice
Jamshidi, Michael
Jeane, La Deana
Jemison, Thomas
Kasian, Stefan
Kassian, Stefan
Kaufmann, Andrew
Kelemen, Ramona
King, Denette
King, Nicole
Kooima, Jessica
Kooima, Jessica
Kopcio, Jordan
Kwan, Calvin
Larke, Daniel
Lewis, Danielle

Lima, Paula
Lloyd, Joshua
Maddox, Adam
Magee, Ashley
Markham, Jennifer
Martell, Casey
Maschak, Jeannine
Maxwell, Erin
May, Jasmine
Mayer, Alexandra
McCarthy, Brendan
McDaniel, Allison
McHenry, Schuyler
McHenry, Schuyler
McWilliams, Kenneth
Miller, Rebecca
Minesaki, Andrea
Monterrey, Dayna
Monterrey, Dayna
Moore, Brandi
Mora, Carmen
Moroso, Heather
Muhammad, Hanifah
Mulkey, Stacey
Murray, Michael
Nelson, William
Nichols, Douglas
Nix, Valerie
Norris, Kristi
Odgren-Cole, Jill
Olic, Sandra
Patrice, Analiah
Paulson, Heather
Peace, Timothy
Peffley, Elisabeth
Peronel, Magda
Pierre, Jennifer
Predmore, Leslie
Psenka, Jonathan
Quintanar, Noemi
Rada, Teresa
Ramsey, Theresa
Reily, Joshua
Retz, Michelle
Riaz, Samar
Richardson, Dorian
Riley, Jade

Ruinard, Leytocha
Sayegh, Jamil
Sax, Rebekkah
Seder, Jeffrey
Shams, Marcus
Sharaf, Sydney
Sheehan, James
Smialek Ford, Kiera
Smith, Todd
Smithers, Jillian
Steinberger, Katrina
Stowell, Aaron
Streisfeld, Robert
Sweet, Frank
Tamburri, Frank
Tenney, Michelle
Thanki, Meghana
Tims, Charmonique
Tizio, Gina
Triscuit, chad
Tucker, Michelle
Vacik, Deborah
Waite, Amy
Wallace, Norman
Warren, Brittany
Wayne, Emilee
Weiss, S.A. Decker
Weyrich, Orville
Whittemore, Ashley
Wikramanayake, Lahari
Williford, Kimberly
Worsham, Ayesha
Wright, Shenice
Yanez, JoAnn
Yosef, Isaac
Zamora, Jamie
Zorensky, Ben

D. Retire Medical License

Alter, Benjamin
Atkins, Adriane
Fok, Katarina
Myers, Robert

E. Initial Certificate to Dispense

Bala, Sarumathy
Britz, Julia
Milhizer, Ashley

- F. Reinstatement Certificate to Dispense
 - Crocker, Ephraim
 - Mitchell, William
 - Peffley, Elisabeth
 - Raisanen, Peter
 - Schafferman, Madelein
 - Stills, Sharon
 - Zorensky, Ben

- G. Initial Certificate to Engage in a Clinical Training Program
 - Armbrister, Shayne
 - Bhatt, Neha
 - Colleton, Shemikah
 - Conway, Daniel
 - Dulak, Samantha
 - Ellis, Amanda
 - Gray, Melanie
 - Hawkins, Kelsey
 - Jabbour, Hanna
 - Kilwine, Amber
 - Lyche, Sarah
 - Lyman, Margaret
 - Mammano, Thomas
 - McClelland, Ashley
 - Mourt, Melanie
 - Russell, Roseline
 - Shim, Grace
 - Springhetti, Jessica
 - Trabulci, Joao

- H. Renewal Certificate to Engage in a Clinical Training Program
 - Adesina, Olywatimilehin
 - Bedford, Sarah
 - Emile, Michelle
 - Fielding, Morgan
 - Gerais, Alaa
 - Herndon, Shaye
 - Mahoney, Jenalee
 - Moore, Lauren
 - Newell, Kristin
 - Newman, Bailey
 - Patel, Swikar
 - Scott, Shay-Ann
 - Shaw, Elizabeth
 - Smolic, Noelle
 - Spangler, Sandra
 - Torassa, Lauren
 - Trapp, Jordan

Vazquez, Gerardo
Wise, Elizabeth

I. Renewal Certificate to Dispense
Nenninger, Steve

J. Initial Certificate to Conduct a Preceptorship Training Program

Consent Agenda Vote: Dr. Popiel made a motion to approve consent agenda items 4 A – J. Seconded by Dr. Rubin. Roll Call: Motion Carried 7 Ayes.

| | VOTE | SADILEK Chair | POPIEL Vice Chair | TIBBITTS Sec. /Tres. | GALAN | CAMPBELL | RUBIN | SPAT |
|---------|------|------------------|-------------------------|-------------------------|-------|----------|-------|------|
| Yes | 7 | x | x | x | x | x | x | x |
| No | 0 | | | | | | | |
| Abstain | 0 | | | | | | | |
| Absent | 0 | | | | | | | |
| Recused | 0 | | | | | | | |
| Vacant | 0 | | | | | | | |

5. REVIEW, CONSIDERATION, AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING THE FOLLOWING BOARD CASES.

A. Letha Martin, Case No., 20-137 Initial Review

Ms. Anthony summarized the Board received a request for licensure verification of Letha Martin. Upon review, it was discovered Ms. Martin was using the naturopathic credentials, but does not hold a naturopathic medical license.

Ms. Martin, stated she holds a degree from the American Association of Drugless Practitioners. Referring to the business card produced as evidence in this case by the Board, Ms. Martin said she does not know where the business card reflecting she is a naturopath came from.

Dr. Rubin pointed out the Board had evidence of her referring to herself as a naturopathic or referring to the clinic as a naturopathic wellness center. He commented that it looks like she has a medical practice, but does not have a license to practice medicine.

Ms. Martin stated she does have HealthScan, but does not have an actual medical facility. Dr. Rubin commented it does state Naturopath on the website, you are not a licensed physician, but you are referring to yourself as one. Ms. Martin stated she removed it when she got the letter from the Board.

Dr. Sadilek pointed out Ms. Martin does mention naturopathic and holistic medicine on her website. Dr. Sadilek made a motion that Ms. Martin remove anything from her website that has to do with naturopathic medicine or anything that could lead the public to believe she is licensed as a naturopathic physician.

Dr. Rubin accessed Ms. Martin’s website on his device during the meeting and pointed out although she had stated earlier in the meeting naturopathic references had been removed, he counted at least 5 references in her current bio, finding her use of the AzNMA logo numerous times, she mentions putting herself through medical school and stated she has medical credentials, all which would lead the public to believe she is a naturopathic physician.

Dr. Sadilek amended his motion to issue a cease and desist order to Ms. Martin, requiring her to remove anything from her website and the web in general, that would lead the public to believe she is a naturopathic physician. Seconded by Dr. Rubin.
Roll Call: Motion Carried 7 Ayes.

| | VOTE | SADILEK Chair | POPIEL Vice Chair | TIBBITTS Sec. /Tres. | GALAN | CAMPBELL | RUBIN | SPAT |
|---------|------|------------------|-------------------------|-------------------------|-------|----------|-------|------|
| Yes | 7 | x | x | x | x | x | x | x |
| No | 0 | | | | | | | |
| Abstain | 0 | | | | | | | |
| Absent | 0 | | | | | | | |
| Recused | 0 | | | | | | | |
| Vacant | 0 | | | | | | | |

6. REVIEW, CONSIDERATION, AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING OPENING A COMPLAINT AGAINST DR. JOHN ELDRIDGE.

Ms. Anthony summarized, on January 11, 2018 Dr. Eldridge entered into a consent agreement with the Board regarding case no. 16-060. On July 11, 2019 the Board considered case no. 19-121, regarding non-compliance of the consent agreement, and voted the matter to Formal Hearing. Dr. Eldridge failed to renew his medical license in a timely manner, and the license was suspended based on statute. Dr. Eldridge was notified of the suspension, however continued to practice on a suspended license.

Dr. Eldridge was present along with Attorney Mandi Karvis.

Ms. Galvin, A.A. G explained that the license expired because Dr. Eldridge failed to renew his license in a timely manner. Because he had been notified of a pending complaint before the Board, the license was suspended by operation of law. Evidence shows Dr. Eldridge continued to write prescriptions while his license was suspended. The current matter before the Board is a decision on whether or not to open a complaint based the information the Board has.

Ms. Karvis stated Dr. Eldridge was not aware his license was suspended until he was visited by DEA agents on March 3rd.

Dr. Popiel pointed out that there is confirmation the notice of suspension was sent by this Board to Dr. Eldridge by both email and mail, with evidence of receipt.

Ms. Karvis stated the computer primarily used by Dr. Eldridge was seized by the DEA.

Dr. Popiel stated just because you don't have that computer doesn't mean you can't access that email. Dr. Eldridge stated he did not have access to another computer. Dr. Sadilek asked how he is receiving email now. Dr. Eldridge stated he is not receiving emails. Dr. Popiel stated the Board made great effort to notify, and it is the responsibility of Dr. Eldridge to renew on time.

Dr. Rubin stated he agreed with Dr. Popiel, and we need to understand he is perfectly capable of accessing the PMP and write prescriptions. It is the responsible of Dr. Eldridge to make certain his license is in good standing.

Dr. Campbell made a motion to open a complaint based on the information provided the Board. Ms. Galan seconded. Roll Call: Motion Carried 7 Ayes.

| | VOTE | SADILEK Chair | POPIEL Vice Chair | TIBBITTS Sec. /Tres. | GALAN | CAMPBELL | RUBIN | SPAT |
|---------|------|------------------|-------------------------|-------------------------|-------|----------|-------|------|
| Yes | 7 | x | x | x | x | x | x | x |
| No | 0 | | | | | | | |
| Abstain | 0 | | | | | | | |
| Absent | 0 | | | | | | | |
| Recused | 0 | | | | | | | |
| Vacant | 0 | | | | | | | |

7. REVIEW, CONSIDERATION, AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING POSSIBLE SUMMARY SUSPENSION OF DR. JOHN ELDRIDGE'S LICENSE FOR PRACTICING ON SUSPENDED LICENSE.

Dr. Popiel asked if the physicians receive notification when they renew. Ms. Anthony confirmed that when renewing online, the confirmation is immediate and the license printed at that time. When renewed via form, the Physician is notified via email once the application is processed with instructions on how to print the license off the website. Dr. Popiel asked if physicians are required to have copies of that visible. Ms. Anthony verified physicians are required to have a current license and/or certification displayed. Dr. Popiel stated so regardless, there was not an active medical license displayed in the office. There is no good argument here and we have him prescribing without a license.

Ms. Karvis stated the license expired 60 days after the due date would have been in March. Ms. Galvin, A.A.G, stated the 60 day statue does not apply to Dr. Eldridge because he had been notified of a Board case. Dr. Eldridge has been practicing on a suspended license.

2:01p.m. Dr. Sadilek made a motion to go into Executive Session for Legal Advice. Seconded by Dr. Spat. Motion Carried 7 Ayes.

2:03p.m. The Board resumed Open Session.

Dr. Campbell made a motion to move the case to Formal Hearing to include the 2019 case, to be heard in front of the Board. Dr. Sadilek seconded the motion. After discussion by the Board members regarding sending the case to Office of Administrative Hearing,

Dr. Campbell rescinded his original motion. Dr. Campbell made a motion to move this case to Formal Hearing and combine it with the 2019 case, recognizing Dr. Eldridge's license is currently suspended under 32-3202. Seconded by Dr. Sadilek. Roll Call: Motion Carried 7 Ayes.

| | VOTE | SADILEK Chair | POPIEL Vice Chair | TIBBITTS Sec. /Tres. | GALAN | CAMPBELL | RUBIN | SPAT |
|---------|------|------------------|-------------------------|-------------------------|-------|----------|-------|------|
| Yes | 7 | x | x | x | x | x | x | x |
| No | 0 | | | | | | | |
| Abstain | 0 | | | | | | | |
| Absent | 0 | | | | | | | |
| Recused | 0 | | | | | | | |
| Vacant | 0 | | | | | | | |

Dr. Campbell made a motion have the combined cases heard by the Office of Administrative Hearing. In the event it cannot be heard by OAH in a timely manner, Board staff has the discretion to schedule it to be heard by the Board. Seconded by Dr. Rubin. Roll Call: Motion Carried 7 Ayes.

| | VOTE | SADILEK Chair | POPIEL Vice Chair | TIBBITTS Sec. /Tres. | GALAN | CAMPBELL | RUBIN | SPAT |
|---------|------|------------------|-------------------------|-------------------------|-------|----------|-------|------|
| Yes | 7 | x | x | x | x | x | x | x |
| No | 0 | | | | | | | |
| Abstain | 0 | | | | | | | |
| Absent | 0 | | | | | | | |
| Recused | 0 | | | | | | | |
| Vacant | 0 | | | | | | | |

8. CONSENT AGENDA VOTE. REVIEW, CONSIDERATION, AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING DRAFT MINUTES.

- A. Draft Minutes of January 9, 2020 Meeting.
- B. Draft Executive Session Minutes, January 9, 2020 2:51 p.m.
- C. Draft Executive Session Minutes, January 9, 2020 3:29 p.m.

Dr. Popiel made a motion to approve items 8 A-C. Seconded by Dr. Rubin. Motion Carried 7 Ayes.

| | VOTE | SADILEK Chair | POPIEL Vice Chair | TIBBITTS Sec. /Tres. | GALAN | CAMPBELL | RUBIN | SPAT |
|---------|------|------------------|-------------------------|-------------------------|-------|----------|-------|------|
| Yes | 7 | x | x | x | x | x | x | x |
| No | 0 | | | | | | | |
| Abstain | 0 | | | | | | | |
| Absent | 0 | | | | | | | |
| Recused | 0 | | | | | | | |
| Vacant | 0 | | | | | | | |

9. REVIEW, CONSIDERATION AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING APPLICATIONS FOR CLINICAL TRAINING

A. Christopher Davis

Ms. Anthony summarized this is an application for clinical training where the applicant indicated an affirmative answer to two of the background questions. Applicant provided written supplement regarding the affirmative answer involving a potential health issue, and the affirmative answer regarding a 2013 open container charge, and 2014 DUI charge.

Dr. Sadilek asked applicant if he currently had any issues with alcohol. Applicant answered no, he does not. Dr. Sadilek asked applicant if he had paid all the fines associated with the 2013 and 2014 incidents. Applicant confirmed he has paid all the fees and fines, participated in court ordered counseling and U/A testing associated with both, and he is no longer being monitored.

Dr. Campbell, asked applicant if he has had any contact with law enforcement related to alcohol since the 2014 incident. Applicant stated he has not.

Dr. Sadilek made a motion to approve the application for clinical training. Dr. Rubin seconded the motion. Roll Call: Motion Carried 7 Ayes.

| | VOTE | SADILEK Chair | POPIEL Vice Chair | TIBBITTS Sec. /Tres. | GALAN | CAMPBELL | RUBIN | SPAT |
|---------|------|------------------|-------------------------|-------------------------|-------|----------|-------|------|
| Yes | 7 | x | x | x | x | x | x | x |
| No | 0 | | | | | | | |
| Abstain | 0 | | | | | | | |
| Absent | 0 | | | | | | | |
| Recused | 0 | | | | | | | |
| Vacant | 0 | | | | | | | |

2:58 p.m. Break

3:05 p.m. The Board Resumed Open Session

10. REVIEW, CONSIDERATION AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING RENEWAL OF MEDICAL LICENSE.

Dr. Rubin recused himself.

A. Dr. Jelina Ip

Ms. Anthony summarized the application for renewal of medical license for Dr. Ip, outlining the current licensure restriction on Dr. Ip’s license, the cases pending before OAH, and the pending criminal trial.

Ms. Galvin stated the applicant made a timely renewal, and has pending matters before the Board, the license continues until such time that the matters resolve.

Dr. Sadilek made a motion to take no action at this time, the status quo remains in

place. Seconded by Dr. Spat. Motion Carried.

| | VOTE | SADILEK Chair | POPIEL Vice Chair | TIBBITTS Sec. /Tres. | GALAN | CAMPBELL | RUBIN | SPAT |
|---------|------|------------------|-------------------------|-------------------------|-------|----------|-------|------|
| Yes | 6 | x | x | x | x | x | | x |
| No | 0 | | | | | | | |
| Abstain | 0 | | | | | | | |
| Absent | 0 | | | | | | | |
| Recused | 1 | | | | | | x | |
| Vacant | 0 | | | | | | | |

B. Dr. Dan Rubin

Dr. Sadilek made a motion to approved item 10 B. Seconded by Ms. Galan. Motion Carried.

| | VOTE | SADILEK Chair | POPIEL Vice Chair | TIBBITTS Sec. /Tres. | GALAN | CAMPBELL | RUBIN | SPAT |
|---------|------|------------------|-------------------------|-------------------------|-------|----------|-------|------|
| Yes | 6 | x | x | x | x | x | | x |
| No | 0 | | | | | | | |
| Abstain | 0 | | | | | | | |
| Absent | 0 | | | | | | | |
| Recused | 1 | | | | | | x | |
| Vacant | 0 | | | | | | | |

C. Dr. Debora Smolinski

Dr. Sadilek made a motion to approve item 10 B. Seconded by Dr. Spat. Motion Carried .

| | VOTE | SADILEK Chair | POPIEL Vice Chair | TIBBITTS Sec. /Tres. | GALAN | CAMPBELL | RUBIN | SPAT |
|---------|------|------------------|-------------------------|-------------------------|-------|----------|-------|------|
| Yes | 6 | x | x | x | x | x | | x |
| No | 0 | | | | | | | |
| Abstain | 0 | | | | | | | |
| Absent | 0 | | | | | | | |
| Recused | 1 | | | | | | x | |
| Vacant | 0 | | | | | | | |

D. Dr. Melissa Coats

Dr. Sadilek made a motion to approve items 10 D. Seconded by Dr. Campbell. Motion Carried.

| | VOTE | SADILEK Chair | POPIEL Vice Chair | TIBBITTS Sec. /Tres. | GALAN | CAMPBELL | RUBIN | SPAT |
|---------|------|------------------|-------------------------|-------------------------|-------|----------|-------|------|
| Yes | 6 | x | x | x | x | x | | x |
| No | 0 | | | | | | | |
| Abstain | 0 | | | | | | | |
| Absent | 0 | | | | | | | |
| Recused | 1 | | | | | | x | |
| Vacant | 0 | | | | | | | |

- 11. REVIEW, CONSIDERATION AND DISCUSSION REGARDING LEGISLATIVE UPDATE.**
Ms. Anthony gave an update of current legislation. No action required or taken.
- 12. REVIEW, CONSIDERATION, AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING HB 2809 AND POSSIBLE REDUCTION IN BOARD REVENUE.**
Ms. Anthony gave a summary of HB 2809, and ways to reduce the revenue. No action required or taken.
- 13. EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPORT**
 - A. Budget
 - B. Current Licensee and Certificate Holder Numbers
 - C. Current Number of Board Cases Under Investigation, Pending Before OAH, or On Hold Pending Outcome of Criminal Case.No action required or taken.
- 14. FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS**
None Requested.
- 15. CALL TO THE PUBLIC**
No requests received.
- 16. ADJOURNMENT**
The Board adjourned at 3:30 p.m.