



State of Arizona Naturopathic Physicians Medical Board

“Protecting the Public’s Health”

1740 W. Adams, Ste. 3002 • Phoenix, AZ 85007 • Telephone 602-542-8242

Website www.aznd.gov

TTY for Americans with Disability 800-367-8939 • Disability Voice Relay 800-842-4681

Douglas A. Ducey – Governor

Dr. Bruce Sadilek, ND – Chair • Vacant, – Vice Chair- Physician Member • Karen Tibbitts, - Public Member

Vacant,- Physician Member • Diva Galan, - Public Member

Heston Silbert, - Public Member • Dr. Brian J. Popiel, - Physician Member

MINUTES

BOARD MEETING

**Thursday, February 8, 2018 • 1:00 p.m. • Board Room C
1740 W. Adams Phoenix, AZ 85007**

1. CALL TO ORDER BY PRESIDING OFFICER

Dr. Sadilek called the meeting to order at 1:13 pm.

A. Roll call of Board members and establishment of a quorum to conduct meetings.

		SADILEK Chair	Vacant Vice Chair	TIBBITTS Sec. /Tres.	POPIEL	GALAN	SILBERT	Vacant
Present	4	x		x	x	x		
Absent	1						x	
Vacant	2		x					x

B. Acknowledgement of presence of Board staff and legal counsel.

Ms. Sabrina Khan, Assistant Attorney General, Ms. Gail Anthony, Executive Director.

2. DECLARATION OF CONFLICTS OF INTEREST

Dr. Sadilek declared he would be recusing himself from item 7(B), and 9(F).

3. CIVILITY STATEMENT

Dr. Sadilek read the civility statement.

4. CONSENT AGENDA – REVIEW, CONSIDERATION, AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING APPROVAL OF THE FOLLOWING APPLICATIONS.

A. Naturopathic Medical License by Examination

Mitchell, Sasha

B. Naturopathic Medical License Reinstatement of Retired License

Jemison, Thomas (temporary license issued in accordance with A.R.S. § 32-1522.01)

C. Renewal Naturopathic Medical License

Abel, Larry

Alibrio, Alice
Amerine, Lisa
Anderson, Kristy
Archambault, Brian
Arthurs, Kevon
Baca, Amalia
Baca, Amalia
Bailey, Robin
Bakty-Johnson, Esti
Bantel, Dawn
Baral, Matthew
Belt, Amber
Binder, Tiffany
Binder, Tiffany
Borsa, Robin
Botham, Jennifer
Bramstedt, Jessica
Burton-Teed, Blythe
Butner, Lana
Buxbaum, Dane
Cain, Briana
Cameron, Kathryn
Campbell, Erica
Caravone, Kimberly
Cavaiola, Matthew
Ceballos-Logan, Gladys
Chilcoat, Aisha
Christian, Shonna
Cisar, Leslie
Compton, Christina
Coracides, Alexander
Coss, Mario
Craig, David
Cramer, David
Cummins, Emy
D'Aprile, Delores
D'Armanta, Annette
Despotides, Bianca
Dickens, Andrew
Doak, E. Friederike
Dubasik, Valentina
Dye, John
Ealy, Henry
Eastman, Carole
Edwards, Kevin
Elton, Jennifer
Esquerdo, Ramon
Exkart, Kayla
Falkner, Michaela
Feaster, Joanne
Ferguson, Linda

Feria, Lilia
Finker, Jillian
Fitzgibbons, Bridget
Flores, Filberto
Fontaine, De Adrea
Ford, Rebecca
Garrett-Shortly, Sabine
Girard, Christine
Graham, Sherdeen
Graham, Stephanie
Granger, Cheryl
Green, Victoria
Grise, Diane
Gustavson, Rebecca
Hamilton, Tursha
Hawes, Courtney
Hawk, Diane
Hawkins, Susan
Hazel, Sara
Helms, Laurent Stephun
Hering, Lance
Hernandez, Matthew
Hesler, Sean
Hesler,, Carolyn
Highsmith, Tiffany
Hilli, Lisa
Hinojosa, Judith
Holiday, Luke
Holiday, Luke
Hoover, Tanisha
Hughes, Melissa
Hutyrova, Daniela
Issels, Christian
Jackson, Janice
Janjua, Kiran
Janson, Michele
Johnson, Cheryl
Jones, Ana
Just, Scott
Kamin, Katherine
Karampahtsis, Emmanouil
Karim, Shairoz
Kasian, Stefan
Kellum, Nicole
Keranen, Emily
Kerivsky, Ross H.
Kerr, Veronique
Kim, Linda
Kinsley, India
Kooima, Jessica
Krukowski, Jody

Larke, Daniel
LaRoche, Sara
Larrow, Anita
Lee, YoungJu
Livengood-Anderson, Elizabeth
Lopez, Eric Edward
LoRal, Linton
Magee, Ashley
Maltais, Shannon
Maschak, Jeannine
Matthias, Ronald
Mayer, Alexander
McCarthy, Brendan
McConnell, Bryan
Mcgee, Heather
McWilliams, Kenneth
Miller, Alicia
Minesaki, Andrea
Mnguni, Sibongile
Mobley, Stacy
Mora, Carmen
Muhammad, Hanifah
Mulkey, Stacy
Myers, Robert
Nandyla, Lakshmi
Navarro, Alma
Needle, Jessica
Neeley, Kyle
Nelson, William
Nguyen, Krystine
Nichols, Douglas
Nordin, Anna
Noronha, Bethania
Olic, Sandra
Patrice, Analiah
Patterseon, Chad
Peronel, Magda
Peruch, Tracy
Pihlgren, Lauren
Polec, Will
Potts, Jeffrey
Powell, Lahnor
Psenka, Jonathan
Purvis, Kathryn
Rader, Alan
Reker, Mary
Retz, Michelle
Riaz, Samar
Romero, Kelly
Rose, Katherine
Rubin, Daniel

Ruiz, Robert
Ruiz, Vanessa
Sabatier, Steven
Salzwedel, Kristen
Sax, Rebekkah
Sayadian, Serop
Scher, Bruce
Schwaiger, Timothy
Sears, Rory
Seder, Jeffrey
Sheehan, James
Sims, DeJarra
Singler, Kirsten
Smialek Ford, Kiera
Smith Pingel, Patricia
Smith, Todd
Smithers, Jillian
St. Rose, John
Stouk, Olya
Stratton, Susan
Streisfeld, Robert
Suhaila, Lena
Tallcouch, Damon
Tallman, David
Tamburri, Frank
Tapia, Paola
Teale, Camille
Tenney, Michelle
Tobar, Shanna
Tucker, Michelle
Vacik, Deborah
Van der Veer, Karen
Van Driel, Evan
Vassighi, Nazanin
Vaughan, Karen
Victor, Erin
Victor, Erin
Visser, Timothy
Waddell, Shayla
Waite, Amy
Waldman, Renee
Wallace, Kevin
Walsh, Bridget
Weiss, S.A. Decker
Whaley, Amanda
Whittemore, Ashley
Wikramanayake, Lahari
Willfahrt, Karen
Williams, Mercedes
Williamson, John
Wilson, Kimberly

Winter, Erin
Wooten, Tracy
Worsham, Ayesha
Yerby, Christie
Zamora, Jamie

D. Initial Certificate to Dispense

Dye, John
Edwards, Kevin
Shenkman, Brett
White, Iasha

E. Retire Medical License

Dallman, Terra
Loschert, Amy-Jane
Mauss, Johanna
Muhammad, Asia
Mullis, Nancy

F. Renewal Certificate to Dispense

Green, Victoria
Ian, Hannah

G. Initial Certificate to Conduct a Preceptorship

Bayrd, Shanna
Cervigni, Maria
Icard, Melanie

H. Initial Certificate to Engage in a Preceptorship

Shannon, Jillian

I. Initial Specialty Certificate

Coats, Melissa
Martell, Casey

J. Renewal Certificate to Engage in a Clinical Training Program

Adesina, OluwaTimplehin
Dastas, Jose
Farooq, Anees
Jones, Greg
Kelemen, Ramona
Manter, Alexander
Mosley, Mariah
Mostofo, Hasan
Murphy, Julie
Prince, Carolyn
Rabie, Homan
Richardson, Dorian
Royer, Lacey
Vazquez, Gerardo
Zyglis, Elliot

Consent Agenda Vote. Dr. Sadilek made a motion to approve agenda items 4 A-J. Seconded by Ms. Galan. Motion Carried 4 Ayes, 1 Absent, 2 Vacant.

	VOTE	SADILEK Chair	Vacant Vice Chair	TIBBITTS Sec. / Tres.	POPIEL	GALAN	SILBERT	Vacant
Yes	4	x		x	x	x		
No	0							
Abstain	0							
Absent	1						x	
Recused	0							
Vacant	2		x					x

5. REVIEW, CONSIDERATION, AND POSSIBLE ACTION, REGARDING BOARD ACTION ON JANUARY 11, 2018 IN BOARD CASE NO. 17-074, DR. ARDESCHIR MEHRABANI, N.D, TO INCLUDE RESCINDING THE NON-DISCIPLINARY CONSENT AGREEMENT, LETTER OF CONCERN, AND THE NON-DISCIPLINARY ORDER FOR CONTINUING EDUCATION.

Mr. Artie Eaves, legal representative for Dr. Mehrabani was present. Ms. Anthony provided a summary of the case. Mr. Eaves provided a statement and summary of Dr. Mehrabani's practice. Dr. Sadilek made a motion to go into Executive Session for legal advice. Seconded by Ms. Galan. Motion carried 4 Ayes, 0 Nays, 1 Absent, 2 Vacant.

The Board returned to regular session at 1:40 pm. Dr. Popiel referenced statements made by Dr. Marabani at the meeting of January 11, 2018, regarding his implementation of an electronic record keeping system, and asked if the electronic system is currently being utilized. Mr. Eaves stated he believed Dr. Marabani is in the process of uploading charts into the system and was not sure if the system was in use at this time. Dr. Popiel stated that Dr. Marabani mentioned he has made significant changes to his charting since the notice of this case. Mr. Eaves confirmed that statement.

Dr. Sadilek stated Dr. Marabani's chart notes go to other providers and his charting is unacceptable. Dr. Popiel commented that Dr. Marabani also teaches students, so there is a concern as to what he is teaching these student if he does not understand how to do an appropriate chart note, and he would anticipate Dr. Marabani's charting to be significantly improved upon the notice of this case. Dr. Popiel stated the Board would like to confirm improved charting practices through a chart review.

Ms. Tibbitts stated that she would like to see 10 charts from December through February.

Dr. Sadilek made a motion to rescind the non-disciplinary consent agreement, rescind the letter of concern, rescind the non-disciplinary order for continuing medical education, obtain and review 10 charts from December of 2017 through the end of February 2018, and upon review completion, bring back the case to the Board. Seconded by Dr. Popiel. Roll Call Vote: Ms. Galan; Nay - explaining she believes this case warrants disciplinary action, Ms. Tibbitts; Aye, Dr. Popiel; Aye, Dr. Sadilek; Aye. Motion Carried 3 Ayes, 1 Nay, 1 Absent, 2 Vacant.

	VOTE	SADILEK Chair	Vacant Vice Chair	TIBBITTS Sec. / Tres.	POPIEL	GALAN	SILBERT	Vacant
Yes	3	x		x	x			
No	1					x		
Abstain	0							

Absent	1						x	
Recused	0							
Vacant	2		x					x

6. REVIEW, CONSIDERATION, AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING BOARD CASE NO. 17-074, DR. ARDESCHIR MEHRABANI, N.D.

Review of this matter is tabled pending review of records as stated in agenda item (5).

7. REVIEW, CONSIDERATION, AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING THE FOLLOWING BOARD CASES.

A. Dr. Debora Chelson, Case No. 17-081 - Investigative Interview

Dr. Chelson was present. Ms. Anthony provided a summary of the case. Dr. Chelson stated she began working for a clinic which would provide her with patients to certify for medical marijuana, that she would see the patients at her clinic and the medical records would be sent to her electronically, she indicated she no longer works for clinic. Dr. Chelson stated the reason she could not locate one of the patient records is because it was placed in the wrong electronic folder, and commented she charts for the medical marijuana patients differently from what she referred to as her "real patients", meaning the patients who she will see again.

Dr. Sadilek stated that those are her patients and the charting should be the same, a SOAP note format.

Dr. Chelson stated she always uses a SOAP note format.

Ms. Galan stated she has issue with Dr. Chelson's noncompliance with the Board investigation.

Dr. Chelson stated she had been in front of the Board in October of 2016, so she was tense when dealing with Ms. Anthony during the investigation.

Ms. Galan stated that because Dr. Chelson had been in front of the Board for a prior incident, she would have been familiar with the processes and is even more concerned with her noncompliance.

Dr. Sadilek made a motion to go into Executive Session for Legal Advice. Seconded by Dr. Popiel. Motion Carried 4 ayes, 0 Nays, 1 Absent, 2 Vacant.

The Board returned to Regular session at 2:45 pm. An administrative error was discovered during the course of board discussion. Dr. Sadilek made a motion to continue this matter until the next board meeting. Seconded by Dr. Popiel. Roll Call Vote: Ms. Galan; Aye, Ms. Tibbitts; Aye, Dr. Popiel; Aye, Dr. Sadilek; Aye. Motion Carried 4 Ayes, 0 Nay, 1 Absent, 2 Vacant.

	VOTE	SADILEK Chair	Vacant Vice Chair	TIBBITTS Sec. /Tres.	POPIEL	GALAN	SILBERT	Vacant
Yes	4	x		x	x	x		
No	0							
Abstain	0							
Absent	1						x	
Recused	0							
Vacant	2		x					x

B. Dr. Michael Miles, Case No. 17-083 - Investigative Interview

Dr. Sadilek recused himself. This matter was tabled due to lack of quorum.

8. REVIEW, CONSIDERATION, AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING DR. SETH BLACK, CASE NO. 17-084, INCLUDING EVALUATION REPORT.

Dr. Black was present. Ms. Anthony provided a summary of the case.

Dr. Sadilek made a motion to go into Executive Session to discuss confidential information. Seconded by Dr. Popiel. Motion Carried 4 Ayes, 0 Nays, 1 Absent, 2 Vacant.

The Board returned to Regular Session at 3:30 pm. Dr. Sadilek commented he has a concern reinstating Dr. Black to full prescriptive authority at this time.

Dr. Black requested the ability to certify for medical marijuana, and testosterone.

Ms. Galan stated she would want anything drafted to be in keeping with Dr. Suchers recommendations.

Dr. Sadilek made a motion to offer a consent agreement for practice limitation through June 2018, giving Dr. Black the ability to certify for medical marijuana, and prescribe testosterone, but he would not have the ability to prescribe Opioids or Benzodiazapines, the consent agreement utilize Dr. Suchers guidelines as provided in his report from 1/3/2018, where Dr. Black is subject to random drug testing in conjunction to the testing he is already subject to, with reports to Board staff, and requirement for the aftercare program extension for 6 months. In 6 months Dr. Black would be required to come back before the Board for review of progress.

Seconded by Ms. Galan. Roll Call Vote: Ms. Galan; Aye, Ms. Tibbitts; Aye, Dr. Popiel; Aye, Dr. Sadilek; Aye. Motion Carried 4 Ayes, 0 Nay, 1 Absent, 2 Vacant.

	VOTE	SADILEK Chair	Vacant Vice Chair	TIBBITTS Sec. / Tres.	POPIEL	GALAN	SILBERT	Vacant
Yes	4	x		x	x	x		
No	0							
Abstain	0							
Absent	1						x	
Recused	0							
Vacant	2		x					x

9. CONSENT AGENDA, REVIEW, CONSIDERATION, AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING RENEWAL OF MEDICAL LICENSE WITHOUT PREJUDICE TO ANY ONGOING INVESTIGATION.

A. Dr. Debora Chelson

B. Dr. Jelina Ip

C. Dr. Mark Stengler

D. Dr. Francesca Quinn

E. Dr. Kristine Wallace

Dr. Sadilek made a motion to approve items 9 A-E. Seconded by Ms. Tibbitts. Motion carried 4 Ayes, 0 Nays, 1 Absent, 2 Vacant.

	VOTE	SADILEK Chair	Vacant Vice Chair	TIBBITTS Sec. / Tres.	POPIEL	GALAN	SILBERT	Vacant
Yes	4	x		x	x	x		
No	0							
Abstain	0							
Absent	1						x	
Recused	0							
Vacant	2		x					x

F. Dr. Michael Miles- Dr. Sadilek stated his recusal on this item. 9(F) was tabled due to lack of quorum.

10. REVIEW, CONSIDERATION, AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING REQUEST FOR EARLY TERMINATION OF PROBATION, DR. SHONNA CHRISTIAN, CASE NO. 16-052.

Dr. Christian was present. Ms. Anthony provided a summary of the case. Dr. Sadilek asked what Dr. Christian's plans were for her practice. She indicated she will be moving out of state shortly, and wanted to have this matter concluded prior to that time.

Dr. Sadilek made a motion to approve the request for probation termination. Ms. Tibbitts seconded. Roll Call Vote; Ms. Galan; Aye, Ms. Tibbitts; Aye, Dr. Popiel; Aye, Dr. Sadilek; Aye. Motion Carried 4 Ayes, 0 Nays, 1 Absent, 2 Vacant.

	VOTE	SADILEK Chair	Vacant Vice Chair	TIBBITTS Sec. / Tres.	POPIEL	GALAN	SILBERT	Vacant
Yes	4	x		x	x	x		
No	0							
Abstain	0							
Absent	1						x	
Recused	0							
Vacant	2		x					x

11. REVIEW, CONSIDERATION, AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING APPLICATION FOR CERTIFICATE TO ENGAGE IN CLINICAL TRAINING.

A. Powell, Cody

Mr. Powel was present. Ms. Anthony provided a summary of the application. Dr. Sadilek noted the incident involved a DUI from 2007 and questioned if there were any ongoing issues with alcohol or drugs. Mr. Powell stated there had been no other incidents since that date. Dr. Sadilek made a motion to approve the application, Seconded by Dr. Popiel. Roll Call Vote: Ms. Galan; Aye, Ms. Tibbitts; Aye, Dr. Popiel; Aye, Dr. Sadilek; Aye. Motion Carried 4 Ayes, 0 Nays, 1 Absent, 2 Vacant.

	VOTE	SADILEK Chair	Vacant Vice Chair	TIBBITTS Sec. / Tres.	POPIEL	GALAN	SILBERT	Vacant
Yes	4	x		x	x	x		
No	0							
Abstain	0							
Absent	1						x	
Recused	0							
Vacant	2		x					x

B. Ramirez, Jillian

Ms. Ramirez was present. Ms. Anthony provided a summary of the application. Dr. Sadilek noted the incident took place 4 years prior, and questioned if there were any ongoing issues involving this matter. Ms. Ramirez stated there are no ongoing issues. Dr. Sadilek made a motion to approve the application. Seconded by Dr. Popiel. Ms. Galan; Aye, Ms. Tibbitts; Aye, Dr. Popiel; Aye, Dr. Sadilek; Aye. Motion Carried 4 Ayes, 0 Nays, 1 Absent, 2 Vacant.

	VOTE	SADILEK Chair	Vacant Vice Chair	TIBBITTS Sec. / Tres.	POPIEL	GALAN	SILBERT	Vacant
Yes	4	x		x	x	x		
No	0							
Abstain	0							
Absent	1						x	
Recused	0							
Vacant	2		x					x

12. REVIEW, CONSIDERATION, AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING APPLICATION FOR RENEWAL OF MEDICAL LICENSE.

A. Dr. Brian Popiel

B. Dr. Bruce Sadilek

This item was tabled due to lack of quorum.

13. ELECTION OF BOARD OFFICERS

A. Election of Board Chair

Dr. Popiel made a motion to keep Dr. Sadilek as Board Chair. Seconded by Ms. Tibbitts. Motion Carried, 4 Ayes, 1 Absent, 2 Vacant.

B. Election of Board Vice Chair

Dr. Sadilek made a motion to approve Dr. Popiel as Board Vice Chair. Seconded by Ms. Tibbitts. Motion Carried, 4 Ayes, 1 Absent, 2 Vacant.

C. Election of Board Secretary/Treasurer

Dr. Sadilek made a motion to keep Ms. Tibbitts as Board Secretary/Treasurer. Seconded by Ms. Galan. Motion Carried 4 Ayes, 1 Absent, 2 Vacant.

14. APPROVAL OF BOARD MINUTES

A. Regular session minutes of November 9, 2017

Dr. Sadilek made a motion to approve the minutes of November 9, 2017. Seconded by Ms. Tibbitts. Motion Carried, 4 Ayes, 0 Nays, 1 Absent, 2 Vacant.

B. Special session minutes of November 25th, 2017

Dr. Sadilek made a motion to approve the special session minutes of November 25, 2017. Seconded by Ms. Tibbitts. Motion Carried, 4 Ayes, 0 Nays, 1 Absent, 2 Vacant.

C. Regular session minutes of January 11, 2018

Dr. Sadilek made a motion to approve the minutes of January 11, 2018. Ms. Galan stated there was a typo on page 22. Dr. Sadilek made a motion to approve the minutes with the revision of the typo error. Seconded by Dr. Popiel. Motion Carried, 4 Ayes, 0 Nays, 1 Absent, 2 Vacant.

15. EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPORT

A. Budget

B. Licensing and Case Status

C. CME Report

D. AZIP Report

No action required.

16. FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS

Dr. Sadilek requested additional board training by Ms. Khan to be placed on future agendas as schedule permits.

17. CALL TO THE PUBLIC

No public addressed the Board.

18. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting was adjourned at 3:53 pm