



# State of Arizona Naturopathic Physicians Medical Board

“Protecting the Public’s Health”

1740 W. Adams, Ste. 3002 • Phoenix, AZ 85007 • Telephone 602-542-8242

Website www.aznd.gov

TTY for Americans with Disability 800-367-8939 • Disability Voice Relay 800-842-4681

## Douglas A. Ducey – Governor

Dr. Bruce Sadilek, ND – Chair, Dr. Brian J. Popiel, ND – Vice Chair, Karen Tibbitts – Secretary/Treasurer

Divya Galan – Public Member, Heston Silbert – Public Member

Dr. Dan Rubin ND – Physician Member, Dr. Tam Spat – Physician Member

### BOARD MEETING MINUTES DRAFT

Thursday, December 13, 2018 • 12:30 pm • Board Room C

1740 W. Adams Phoenix, AZ 85007

#### 1. CALL TO ORDER BY PRESIDING OFFICER

A. Roll call of Board members and establishment of a quorum to conduct meetings.

Dr. Sadilek called the meeting to order at 12:39 pm. Ms. Anthony called rolled.

	VOTE	SADILEK Chair	POPIEL Vice Chair	TIBBITTS Sec. / Tres.	GALAN	SILBERT	RUBIN	SPAT
Present	5	x	x	x	x		x	x
Absent	1					x		

B. Acknowledgement of presence of Board staff and legal counsel.

Dr. Sadilek acknowledged Ms. Sabrina Khan, Assistant Attorney General, Ms. Gail Anthony, Executive Director.

#### 2. DECLARATIONS OF CONFLICTS OF INTEREST

Dr. Rubin declared a conflict with item 5 (A), Case No. 18-102 and stated he would be recusing from that agenda item. Dr. Rubin stated the following physicians from item 4 (D) worked in his office, Dr. Melissa Coats, Dr. Jessica Stefanski, Dr. Lisa, Alschuler, and Dr. Walter Crinnion. Dr. Rubin stated he would be recusing himself from voting on this item.

#### 3. CIVILITY STATEMENT

Dr. Sadilek read the civility statement into the record

**4. CONSENT AGENDA – REVIEW, CONSIDERATION, AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING APPROVAL OF THE FOLLOWING APPLICATIONS.**

A. Naturopathic Medical License by Examination

Merkey, Allison (temporary license issued in accordance with A.R.S. § 32-1522.01)

B. Naturopathic Medical License by Endorsement

Eye-Englert, Mallory (temporary license issued in accordance with A.R.S. § 32-1522.01)

Griffen, Edward (temporary license issued in accordance with A.R.S. § 32-1522.01)

Ho, Tien

C. Reinstatement of Retired Medical License

Ryan, Natasha (temporary license issued in accordance with A.R.S. § 32-1522.01)

D. Renewal Medical License

Abbott, Crystal

Adams, Konstantina

Aidum, Sima

Albornoz-Sanchez, Leah

Alexandria, Karsten

Alschuler, Lisa

Alvarado, Gilbert

Anguiano, Christian

Armanti, Christian

Arneson, David

Arnold, Frederick

Aton Robins, Nancy

Attah Prince, Ubong

Aussems, Christopher

Bachelier, Aimee

Bain, Jaclyn

Balduzzi, Anthony

Banaian, Azam

Bantel, Dawn

Baral, Mathew

Barnes, Lori

Barreda, Nicole

Bell, Carlie

Bell, Maria

Beltran, Chriselda

Bennett, Sarah

Bird, Robb

Birdsall, Timothy

Boe, Laura  
Boyer, Veronica  
Brassell, Anne Christine  
Brooke Barber, Kenna  
Brown, Joseph  
Brown, Kurtis  
Buratovich, Nick  
Burns, Jennifer  
Butner, Lana  
Carrell, Carol  
Clough, Kelly  
Coats, Faith  
Coats, Melissa  
Contreras-Lopez, Andrea  
Cooke, Rebecca  
Cooke, Tracey  
Coracides, Alexander  
Crinnion, Walter  
Cronin, Courtney  
Crowley, Rachel  
Culver, Alyssa  
Cummins, Emy  
Dagstani, Nael  
Dapcic, Barbara  
Darling-Baj, Mia  
Darragh, Angela  
De La Toree Hogan, Elizabeth  
Deal, Sheldon  
Dean, Jeffrey  
Deroin, Cheryl  
Deville Baden, Lauren  
DiCampli, Jesika  
Dickens, Andres  
Dietagen, Mark  
DiFilippo, Mary  
Donhoue, Whitney  
Dooley, Melonni  
Eastman, Staphanie  
Eaton, Lois  
Eischens, Shawna  
Ellington, Amber

Ellis, Erin  
Ellsworth, Robert  
Engard, Kimberly  
Erxleben, Angela  
Espinol, Raquel  
Ezrre, Barbara  
Fatima, Alhadi  
Feaster, Joanne  
Felton, Lynnea  
Ferchoff, Ryan  
Fine, Anne Marie  
Fischer, Rainer  
Fitzgibbons, Bridget  
Flagler, Lilia  
Flagler, Samuel  
Franco-Chavez, Jessyca  
Freeze, Karen  
Fuller, Carolyn  
Gariboldi, Matthew  
Gastellum, Melissa  
Gentry, Jennifer  
George, Marietta  
Gilbert, Miriam  
Goetz, chad  
Gold, Amy  
Gomendi, Sara  
Gonzales, Mike  
Gorman, Julie  
Gowey, Brandie  
Grady, Elizabeth  
Grey, Laurence  
Grund, Andrea  
Gutowski, Louise  
Haller, Danite  
Ham, Natalie  
Hartman, John  
Hayes, Cynthia  
Herro, Frederick  
Hinojasa, Judith  
Hoang, Melanie  
Hobi, Annette

Hoffman, Jill  
Hull, Ginger  
Immundo, John  
Inouye, Vance  
Irons, Kami  
Issels, Christian  
Ivons, Maryann  
Izold, Adelena  
Jacques, F. Debbie  
James, Cara  
James, Charmainge  
Jamshidi, Michael  
Jarvis, Linda  
Johnson, Eric  
Johnson, Nick  
Jollie, Jane  
Jones, Carmen  
Kaplan, Steven  
Kasdorf, Cheryl  
Katz, Steven  
Kearney, Elizabeth  
Keaton, Dana  
Keilty, Jeni  
Kennedy, Cori  
Khalsa, Sarv Varta  
Khoshaba, Linda  
King, Nicole  
Knapp, Michael  
Kohler McLeod, Gemie  
Krieger-Fiedler, Allyn  
Kruzel, Thomas  
Kwan, Laurinda  
Kwiatkowski, Laura  
Lai, Monique  
Lamb, Karen  
Lambert, Linda  
Landino, Kimberly  
Lane, Kiera  
Lara, Ana  
Lark, Daniel  
Le Provost, Jean-Luc

DRAFT

Lee, Thomas  
Lee-Sedera, Yoojin  
Lewis, Danielle  
Lewis, Leigh  
Lieske, Robert  
Lima, Paula  
Logan, Darla  
Lussier, Spice  
Mackey, Linda  
Marshall, Sarah  
Martell, Casey  
Martell, Laura  
Maturo, Lisa  
Maxson, Cara  
Mayer, Ashley  
Maymon, Scott  
Mazwell, Peggy  
McCalla, Bethany  
McConnell, Michelle  
McCormack, Kristen  
Miles, Devin  
Miles, George  
Minesaki, Andrea  
Mitchell, Kenneth  
Mitchell, Tiffany  
Mitchell, William  
Mittman, Arie  
Mittman, Paul  
Mora, Carmen  
Moreno, Celaine  
Morstein, Mona  
Mullen, Elissa  
Muratore, Kathleen  
Muro, Eugene  
Murray, Mallory  
Murray, Michael  
Myers, Robert  
Neeley, Kyle  
Nenninger, Steve  
Nichols, George  
Nickels, Michele

DRAFT

Nikolic, Elizabeth  
Nix, Valerie  
Nordin, Anna  
Nowak-Stears, Julie  
Nuckolls, Katheryn  
O'Brien, Kareen  
O'Hara, Amy  
Oskin, Jamie  
Oxley, Barbara  
Oxley, John  
Ozalan, Glenn  
Pagano, Taylor  
Palmer, Andrea  
Palzer, Anne  
Papadeas, Nathan  
Parent, Daina  
Peace, Timothy  
Perch, Benita  
Pettitt, Michelle  
Porter, Alexandra  
Porter, Jason  
Predmore, Leslie  
Rada, Teresa  
Rader, Alan  
Raisanen, Peter  
Ramanan, Karthik  
Randahl, Samantha  
Reilly, Joshua  
Rice, Elizabeth  
Richards, Calvin  
Rittling, Carrie  
Robinson, Randall  
Rodriquez, Yolanda  
Romero, Kelly  
Roodvoets, Mitchell  
Rosario Beitel, Sue  
Rudderham, Mark  
Rudderham, Susan  
Ruiz Hernandez, Nidia  
Ruiz, Guillermo  
Runbeck, Craig

DRAFT

Saldivar, Lutea  
Santo, Carlos  
Santora, Marie  
Schwehr, Maureen  
Sears, rory  
Seitz, Stephanie  
Sensenig, James  
Shabez, Edward  
Shams, Marcus  
Shaw, Anne  
Shettell, Jacob  
Shulman, Kathryn  
Sina, Shaida  
Smith, Bradley  
Smith, Jennifer  
Soheily, Saman  
Soto-Johnson, Christy  
Sowards, Dustin  
Spurgeon, James  
St. Rose, John  
Stage, Katrina  
Stefanski, Jessica  
Stevens, June  
Stills, Sharon  
Stone, Carolyn  
Stouk, Olya  
Strand, Roxie  
Strom, Mark  
Strong, Christine  
Sundermeyer, Zahara  
Swan, Farra  
Swartz, Tara  
Szeto, Katherine  
Taylor, Nicole  
Tellier, Krystal  
Thanki, Meghana  
Thatcher, Michelle  
Thom, Dickson  
Thomas, Suzanne  
Toghyani, Jeannette  
Tondora, Christina

DRAFT



Trask, Jennifer  
Turcotte, Michelle  
Turrell, Shana  
Udell, Eric  
Uzick, Michael  
Valentin, Ann-Charlotte  
Vesco, Teresa  
Vitaro, Nathan  
Volk, Kimberly  
Vost, Erika  
Walker, Catherine  
Walker, Samuel  
Wallace, George  
Walters, Sam  
Wasson, Debbie  
Weeshoff, Laura  
Wells, Wendy  
Werner, Stefanie  
West, Kirsten  
Whelchel, Rebecca  
Whitley, Marnie  
Whitney, Michael  
Whittington, Amy  
Wick, Bonnie  
Wilkinson, Charles  
Willhauck, Mihrage  
Williams, Mercedes  
Williford, Kimberly  
Winton, Jeffrey  
Witman, James  
Wojslaw, Heather  
Wolf, Jacob  
Wolf, Jeremy  
Worden, Donese  
Wright, Kimberly  
Yosef, Isaac  
Yost, Kristina  
Zdan, Jill  
Zeller, Barrie  
Zenhausern, Alissia  
Ziol, Judith Ann

DRAFT

Zorensky, Ben

E. Initial Certificate to Dispense

Buermann, Natalie  
Lima, Paula  
Shettell, Jacob

F. Reinstatement of Certificate to Dispense

Lee, YounJu  
Zupa, Victoria

G. Initial Naturopathic Medical Assistant

Rosario, Jennifer

H. Application to Retire Medical License

Bedell Cook, Sarah  
Crocker, Ephraim  
Curtis, Judith  
Moore, Jessica  
Thompson, Rebekah

I. Initial Certificate to Conduct a Preceptorship

Taylor, Jennifer

J. Renewal Certificate to Engage in a Clinical Training Program

Abers, Mareshah  
Amin, Kayla  
Bouchard, Jocelyn  
Davidson, Nicole  
DeCarolis, Anna-Maria  
Deskens, Ashika  
Erndle, Christina  
Euler, Tamara  
Flanery, Jamie  
Goodwin, Taylor  
Greathouse, Robert  
Haase, Kelly  
Hamilton, Danni  
Hartwell, Lillea  
Hiras, Mary  
Iroka, Chineyenwa  
Kamwee, Paw  
Langston, Danielle  
McCormick, Christie  
Mednoza-Ballentine, Stephanie  
Monson, Carly  
Morgado-Slydran, Cecilia

Napier, Natalie  
 Nebedum, Adaeze  
 Obuobi, Samantha  
 Partida, Alexandria  
 Riley, Ashley  
 Ryskowski, Amanda  
 Scally, Ginger  
 Scheeler, Natalie  
 Shaheen Emmalee  
 Simmons, Kurtis  
 Smith, Faye  
 Smith, TyRonda  
 Stein, Ashley  
 Sudweeks, Derek  
 Summers, Jacqualine  
 Swift, Janet  
 Tately, Molly  
 Toole, Cassidy  
 Vanderwoude, Bridget  
 Vohra, Sannah  
 Wendlandt, Jennifer  
 Willey, Sally  
 Zuniga, Samuel

**CONSENT AGENDA VOTE:** Dr. Sadilek made a motion to approved the consent agenda items 4 A-J. Seconded by Ms. Tibbitts. Motion Carried 5 Ayes, 1 Abstain, 1 Absent.

Roll Call: Dr. Spat; Aye, Ms. Galan; Aye, Dr. Popiel; Aye, Dr. Sadilek; Aye, Ms. Tibbitts, Aye. Motion Carried 5 Ayes, 1 Abstain, 1 Absent.

	VOTE	SADILEK Chair	POPIEL Vice Chair	TIBBITTS Sec. / Tres.	GALAN	SILBERT	RUBIN	SPAT
Yes	5	x	x	x	x			x
No	0							
Abstain	1						x	
Absent	1					x		
Recused	0							

**5. REVIEW, CONSIDERATION, AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING THE FOLLOWING BOARD CASES.**

**A. Dr. Colleen Huber, Case Number 18-102, Initial Review**

Dr. Rubin recused in himself from this agenda item. Dr. Huber was present with her Attorney Mr. Steve Mahaffey. Ms. Anthony gave an overview of the case. Dr. Rubin is the complainant in the case and gave an overview of his allegations.

Mr. Silbert joined the meeting ag 12:50 pm.

1:45 pm. Dr. Sadilek made a motion to go into Executive Session for Legal Advice. Seconded by Ms. Galan. Motion Carried 6 Ayes, 1 Recused. The Board returned to Open Session at 2:14 pm.

2:47 pm. Ms. Galan made a motion to go into Executive Session for Legal Advice. Seconded by Dr. Popiel. Motion Carried 6 Ayes

Ms. Silbert left the meeting at 3:13 pm.

Dr. Sadilek made a motion to table the matter for 30 days to allow for Dr. Hubert to make changes to her website. The Board will review any changes made at the next scheduled meeting. Seconded by Dr Popiel. Motion carried 5 Ayes, 1 Recused, 1 Absent. Roll Call: Dr. Spat; Aye, Ms. Galan; Aye, Dr. Popiel; Aye, Dr. Sadilek; Aye, Ms. Tibbittss; Aye.

	VOTE	SADILEK Chair	POPIEL Vice Chair	TIBBITTS Sec. / Tres.	GALAN	SILBERT	RUBIN	SPAT
Yes	5	x	x	x	x			x
No	0							
Abstain	0							
Absent	1					x		
Recused	1						x	

B. Dr. Dylan Krueger, Dr. Michelle Barraza, Case Number 18-106, Initial Review  
Dr. Krueger and Dr. Barraza were present. Ms. Anthony gave an overview of the case. Dr. Rubin made a motion to dismiss the complaint. Seconded by Dr. Spat. Motion Carried 6 Ayes, 1 Absent. Roll Call: Dr. Spat; Aye, Dr. Rubin; Aye, Ms. Galan; Aye, Dr. Popiel; Aye, Dr. Sadilek; Aye, Ms. Tibbittss; Aye.

	VOTE	SADILEK Chair	POPIEL Vice Chair	TIBBITTS Sec. / Tres.	GALAN	SILBERT	RUBIN	SPAT
Yes	6	x	x	x	x		x	x
No	0							
Abstain	0							
Absent	1					x		
Recused	0							

**6. BOARD TRAINING; REVIEW AND DISCUSS THE FOLLOWING.**

- A. Conflict of Interest of Officers and Employees Pursuant to A.R.S. § 38-501, et seq.
  - B. Open Meeting Laws, Role of the Board and Employees, and Administrative Procedures pursuant to A.R.S. § 32-1551.
- Ms. Kahn provided Board training on items 6 A – B. No action required.

**7. REVIEW, CONSIDERATION, AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING APPLICATION FOR RENEWAL OF MEDICAL LICENSE**

- A. Dr. Tam Spat  
Dr. Spat recused himself. Dr. Sadilek made a motion to approved the application for renewal of medical license. Seconded by Dr. Rubin. Motion Carried: 5 Ayes, 1 Recused, 1 Absent.

- B. Dr. Brian Popiel  
Dr. Popiel recused himself. Dr. Rubin made a motion to approve the application for renewal of medical license. Seconded by Ms. Galan. Motion Carried: 5 Ayes, 1 Recused, 1 Absent.

**8. EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPORT**

- A. Budget
  - B. Licensing and Case Status
  - C. Current Board Cases
  - D. Board Review and Ratification of Proposed Consent Agreement Procedures
  - E. Board Review of Disciplinary Guidelines
- No Action required on this agenda item.

**9. FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS**

None

**10. CALL TO THE PUBLIC**

None

**11. ADJOURNMENT**

The meeting was adjourned at 4:14 pm.

DRAFT